



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review Commission
Meeting of October 1, 2009

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Shena Rojemann, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at 610 North Rodeo Drive. (PL 090 2024)

Continued from the July 2, 2009 Design Review Commission meeting.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Yassi Gabbay of Gabbay Architects, on behalf of the property owner, has filed a Track 2 Design Review application to allow a new two-story single-family residence at 610 North Rodeo Drive.

This item was reviewed by the Commission at its February 5 and July 2, 2009 meetings, with the following comments received at the July meeting.

Please see next page

Design Review Commission Requests July 2, 2009	Applicant's Response
1. The design was not appropriate for a this lot size. It seemed to be a New York style building, not Italianate.	In an effort to reduce bulk and mass and create a more residential design, the applicant has: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduced the number of windows; • Removed the columns from the second story, above the entryway; • Recessed the entryway and included corbels below the roofline.
2. The proposed façade appeared 'vanilla' and was lacking detail and distinction. The execution of the details was not working.	The applicant has: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Included more ornate railings at the first and second story windows; • Used larger French doors at the first and second stories; • Further recessed the center window (above the entryway); • Added corbels below the roof line; • Added two more columns to the first story entryway.
3. The windows did not appear to be a true Italianate style.	The applicant removed four windows from the façade and is proposing five larger French doors with the same surrounds as were previously proposed.
4. The front entry appeared to have double story columns. Consider treating the pilasters at the second story differently.	The applicant removed the column features at the second story and recessed only the first story.
5. The window above the entryway appeared to be too large for space.	The window above the entryway has been increased in size while the details surrounding the window have been reduced/removed to create better scale between the elements.
6. The tall thin windows did not seem to be the appropriate scale for the façade.	The applicant has removed all nine tall windows and has replaced them with five wider French doors, which are better scaled.
7. The quoins were not the right proportions.	The applicant adjusted the proportions of the quoins.
8. Provide a detail showing the drainage behind retaining wall along driveway and the property line.	A detail is provided.
9. Add planting between the property line and driveway to lessen the impact of the subterranean garage on the neighbors.	The applicant has not added any planting between the property line and driveway.

The following materials are proposed:

- Smooth stucco walls – painted La Habra Light Beige
- Center wall and steps – aged travertine
- Window & doorway moldings – precast concrete painted light brown
- Windows – dark wood frame, tinted green glass
- Railings – wrought iron
- Roof – grey/brown slate shingles
- Entry door – solid dark mahogany

A materials board and rendering will be presented at the meeting.

Code Compliance Issues

As proposed, the design meets all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on September 21, 2009 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. Staff has received written (see attached letter) and verbal comments from the neighboring property owner to the North, Mr. Rocco Siciliano. His main concerns were regarding the maintenance of the mature shrubs between the property lines and the functionality of the underground parking garage. .

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. *The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.*

As revised, the design appears to be consistent with the "Italianate" style of architecture as designed for a smaller lot, as displayed by the low pitched roof, the flat façade, the tall windows and porte cochere. Therefore, the proposed residence exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

2. *Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.*

As revised, the design incorporates horizontal features such as the bands that are located along the base, middle and near the top of the proposed façade. These bands reduce the vertical appearance of the residence. Additionally, the second story windows have been designed to be shorter than the first story, thus giving the appearance that the second story is not as large as the first story. The applicant has submitted a detailed landscaping plan which proposes a variety of lush groundcover, shrubs and trees which will enhance the garden like quality of the City. Therefore, as revised, the residence appears to minimize the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden quality of the City and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space.

3. *The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.*

As stated in items 1) and 2) above, the residence shall provide a number of elements consistent with the Italianate style architecture while providing appropriate scale and mass to the site. The proposed project utilizes high quality building materials, which shall help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood. Additionally, the landscaping will help to enhance the proposed residence.

4. *The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.*

As revised, the structure exceeds the City's side yard and rear yard setback requirements. The southern elevation contains small windows along the second story which would have a minimal impact on the neighbors privacy. Along the northern elevation, the windows are mostly smaller in size as well and shall reduce any impact to the neighboring property owners. Although the proposed residence has been designed with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors, the Commission may wish to discuss the neighboring property owner's request to maintain the existing lush landscaping located in the rear of the property along the northern side property line (Mr. Siciliano- letter attached).

5. *The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.*

The design patterns in the area are characterized by consistent setbacks and straight driveways located at the side property lines leading to a garage and/or a porte cochere, circular driveways, and a walkway leading from the public sidewalk to the entryway of the residence. The proposed design is consistent with this pattern. The existing neighborhood is composed of one and two-story single-family residences. Thus having design patterns consistent with those of the neighboring properties will ensure harmony between old and new homes in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, the Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and resubmittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends that the Design Review Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Pursuant to Beverly Hills Municipal Code Section 10-3-2420, all aspects of the proposed front yard fencing located at the front property line shall be three feet (3') in height or less.
2. The planter located along the northern side yard shall be a minimum of forty-two inches (42") in height.
3. All trees shall be a minimum of thirty six inch (36") boxes.
4. Any approval by the Commission is for design only; the project is subject to all applicable City zoning regulations.
5. Any future modifications to this approval shall be presented to staff for a determination as to whether the change may be approved by staff (minor) or to the Commission for review. Changes made without City approval may be required to be restored to match the City approved plans.

6. Final plans shall include a color rendering of the front elevation with numbered call-outs and a corresponding legend for all proposed materials and finishes. Spec sheets for windows shall also be provided. This elevation will be used by staff for verification of materials at the project site during construction.
7. A copy of the final conditions of approval per the approved Resolution shall be scanned onto the cover sheet of the final building plans.



SHENA ROJEMANN
Assistant Planner

Attachment:

Letter from Mr. Rocco Siciliano

ROCCO C. SICILIANO
612 NORTH RODEO DRIVE
BEVERLY HILLS, CALIFORNIA 90210

February 4, 2009

To The Members of The
Design Review Commission
of The City of Beverly Hills
at the Public Hearing of
February 6, 2009

Commissioners:

I write this letter to comment on the proposed R-1 Design Review Permit for a new, 2-story single family residence at 610 North Rodeo Drive.

My wife and I own, and have lived next door, at 612 North Rodeo Drive for the past nearly 38 years.

We are most concerned that the 610 north property line adjacent to my property be maintained as closely as possible to the way it is now. By that, we mean that we want to see maintained the existing space between our homes as well as the maintenance of the splendid trees which line the boundary for about 50 percent of the property. I recognize that the existing garage at the 610 property will probably be removed. Hopefully, we would be able to join the new neighbors in planting substantial trees to fill the void created by the garage removal.

I have expressed this concern and request to Ms. Shena Rojemann. I invite you to visit my home to see personally what I mean.

Sincerely,


Rocco C. Siciliano

HOME OFFICE TELEPHONE: 310/276-5912

