



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review Commission
Meeting of October 1, 2009

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Ivy Nguyen, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a second-story addition to an existing single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **480 Hillgreen Drive**. (PL 093 7219)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Marty Esterline, on behalf of the property owner, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow a second-story addition to an existing single-family residence to construct a six bedroom, 3,793 square foot residence (including pool cabana) located at **480 Hillgreen Drive**.

Reason for Review by the Commission

Pursuant to Beverly Hills Municipal Code Section 10-3-4408, no single-family residence located in the Central R-1 zone shall be erected, constructed, altered or remodeled unless the elevations and plans for the exterior portions and areas visible from the street are reviewed and approved by the City. The Design Review Commission shall be the reviewing authority if it has first been determined that the design does not otherwise substantially adhere to a pure architectural style.

The applicant identifies the proposed project as "English Cottage." This project involves a second story addition to an existing residence, and this creates certain constraints to the design that, in staff's opinion, did not allow for the creation of a pure architectural style. The project recalls influences from Tudor and vernacular English cottage styles. The sweeping, main roofline presents a modernized approach to the thatched roof yeoman cottage. Mixed with Tudor-like pitched and half-timbered roofs, this project provides a hybrid of cottage and Tudor styles that have evolved into modern-day Tudor

Revival. One element the Commission might consider strengthening is the chimney's characteristics as this is a prominent feature in Tudor design.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the main house, accessory structure, and walls meet all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Marty Esterline
Project Owner	Cindy and Blaise Antin
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – South of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	6,607 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is a rectangular-shaped lot that averages approximately 76'-0" wide by 78'-0" long lot, located on east side of the 300 block of North Maple Drive between Burton Way and Dayton Way. The existing one-story residence will remain and the second floor addition is proposed. The proposed addition has been verified to be in conformance with Section 10-3-4100, which specifies that remodels within a single-family residence may be altered up to a maximum of 50%. The required front yard setback is 25'-0", and the existing residence is located 14'-8" from the front property line. As the residence conforms to the "non-conforming" section of the Municipal Code, the residence may be permitted to remain in its existing location. Provided, however, that during the construction stage, if the residence exceeds the 50% threshold, the proposed residence must conform to all current regulations.

The abutting properties at the west and east property lines are developed with two-story single-family residences. The streetscape is a mixture of one- and two-story residential homes, with American Colonial and Rural European Revival architectural styles present.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope

The proposed residence would have a total floor area of 3,793 square feet, which is less than the maximum allowable building area (4,143 square feet) for the subject site. As proposed, the residence will be 29'-10" to the highest point of the roof (30'-0" maximum height for a building with a sloped roof is allowed as maximum plate height is 22'-0").

Modulation

The new second floor addition provides slight modulation of the existing single-family residence. The façade is further modulated by the varied roof line styles.

Parking

As required by the Beverly Hills Municipal Code, four parking spaces are required for the six-bedroom project. Parking will be located at the northern elevation (rear) on a concrete slab accessible from the alley and adjacent to the residence at the western elevation accessible from the driveway with the existing curb cut at Hillgreen Drive. Each parking space measures 9'-0" wide by 19'-0" long as required by Code.

Design

The proposed design of the structure includes the following features:

- Tudor Revival influences
- Two stories
- Varying roof lines
- Several windows of differing shapes with wood trim

Materials

The materials and color proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Façade smooth trowel stucco finish – ICI "Raw Twine", taupe color
- Wood windows, trim and shutters (ICI "Wilderness Green", green color)
- Custom made wood front entry door (ICI "Wilderness Green", green color)
- Composite roof shingles (Certain Tweed "Charcoal Black", black shingles)

A material sample board will be available for the Commission's review at the meeting.

Paving

The applicant had proposed less than 400 square feet of paving as permitted in Section 10-3-2422A of the BHMC. The hardscape for the site consists of a driveway approach, which will utilize an existing curb cut and a four feet wide walkway leading to the residence.

Landscape Design

The proposed project will provide for low-growing landscaping and grass ground cover in the front yard (consisting of flowers, variegated flax, lavender and Tuscan Blue). Additionally, several trees will be planted in the front yard (birch trees, Japanese fruitless pear tree, Princess tree).

Additionally, there will be a 3'-0" tall wood picket fence with wood posts at the walkway.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on September 18, 2009 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date, staff has not received any comments (written or oral) in regards to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed to be in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued (construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone).

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. *The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.*

The proposed design and architectural features exhibit several characteristics similar to those defined in the Design Catalogue for English Cottage residences. For example, gable rooflines, windows of differing shapes and smooth pale-colored stucco at the exterior surface are found on the front facade. The balance of the proposed design appears to exhibit an internally compatible design scheme with several modifications.

However, the Commission may wish to discuss whether the proposed design may benefit from more pronounced rooflines or narrower or multi-paned windows (with whimsical geometric shapes as identified in the Design Catalogue) at the front elevation, as well as a more pronounced chimney feature

2. *Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.*

The proposed design utilizes nearly the maximum amount of floor area permitted by the BHMC. The proposed height of the main residence is 29'-10" to the highest point (maximum height allowed by Code is 30'-0" for a sloped roof) with a front façade that measures approximately 53'-0" wide.

The proposed second story addition provides slight modulation at the front façade of the building. The Commission may wish to discuss options of further modulation of the building, with consideration of maintaining the existing first story.

The proposed landscaping plan includes several trees at the front yard and a variety of low-growing plant materials that will enhance the garden quality of the city.

3. *The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.*

The proposed project exhibits an internally compatible design scheme. The project utilizes several high quality building materials including stucco walls with wood window trims and doors, which will help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. *The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.*

The proposed addition meets the side setbacks required. The subject site is located south of south of Olympic Boulevard and west of Roxbury Drive and therefore, shall provide a minimum 5'-0" side yard setback, with a cumulative side yard setback of 20% of the lot width (15.3').

The project has provided a side set back 9'-1" at the west property line and 6'-2" at the east property line; therefore, conforms to the side yards required by the BHMC.

There will be several windows located on the second floor at the west and east elevations which are located in bedrooms and bathrooms. It is not anticipated that the location of the windows will pose a significant effect to the privacy of the neighbors.

- 5. *The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

The properties along Hillgreen Drive are developed with structures varying in size and scale and appear to exhibit primarily American Colonial and Rural European Revival architectural design patterns.

The proposed "English Cottage" design is sensitive to the scale, mass and landscaping of the neighborhood and therefore the proposed development is in harmony with the old and new residences in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and re-submittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, Staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. Any approval by the Commission is for design only; the project is subject to all applicable City zoning regulations.
2. Any future modifications to this approval shall be presented to staff for a determination as to whether the change may be approved by staff (minor) or to the Commission for review. Changes made without City approval may be required to be restored to match the City approved plans.
3. Final plans shall include a color rendering of the front elevation with numbered call-outs and a corresponding legend for all proposed materials and finishes. Spec sheets for windows shall also be provided. This elevation will be used by staff for verification of materials at the project site during construction.
4. A copy of the final conditions of approval per the approved Resolution shall be scanned onto the cover sheet of the final building plans.



IVY NGUYEN
Assistant Planner