



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review Commission
Meeting of October 1, 2009
090005002 / PL 0930434

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Ivy Nguyen, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **306 North Maple Drive**. (PL 093 0434)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Bahram Raeen, on behalf of the property owner, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow a new, two-story, four bedroom, 4,496 square foot single-family residence located at **306 North Maple Drive**. This project was presented to the Commission on September 3, 2009 and the applicant was directed to restudy the items listed below.

Commission Concerns and Applicant Response

Listed below are the Commission's concerns and the applicant's response.

Commission's Comments	Applicant's Response
Maximum height of a building with a flat roof is 25'-0", and shall be reduced to comply with Code.	The applicant has lowered the building height to 24'-7". Additionally, the skylight at the front elevation has been removed.
Residence did not exhibit a unified design. There was discussion of proportionality in regards to the windows, doors, lights on the front elevation, and a simplified design overall.	At the tower, the wrought iron railing has been removed to simplify the design. Pre-cast concrete surrounding the window has been removed. The building façade has been simplified to be stucco. Pre-cast concrete panels that were proposed to be installed at the base

	<p>of the building have been removed.</p> <p>The small windows at the first floor have been simplified with the removal of the mullions and pre-cast concrete surrounds.</p> <p>The windows at the second story balcony flanking the French doors have been removed.</p>
Style of the lighting at the 3'-0" wall at the front yard is not consistent with the design style of the residence.	The applicant has maintained the flat lights at the front gate (sheet A-1).

A copy of the September 3, 2009 staff report is attached for the Commission's reference.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the main house, accessory structure, and walls meet all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Bahram Raeen
Project Owner	Rabin Mizrahi
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – South of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	7,500 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is a rectangular-shaped lot that is 50'-0" wide by 150'-0" long lot, located on east side of the 300 block of North Maple Drive between Burton Way and Dayton Way. The existing one-story residence will be demolished in order to allow for the construction of the proposed project. The abutting properties at the north and south property lines are developed with two-story single-family residences. The streetscape is a mixture of new and existing residential homes, with no prominent architectural style present.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope

The proposed residence would have a total floor area of 4,496 square feet, which is slightly less than the maximum allowable building area (4,500 square feet) for the subject site. As proposed, the residence will be 24'-7" to the highest point of the roof (25'-0" maximum height for a building with a flat roof is allowed as maximum plate height is 22'-0").

Modulation

The main entrance to the principal building contains a walkway with leading to the entryway door, with the main entry door set 4'-0" behind the required 25'-0" front yard setback (one foot further from the previous meeting). The first floor of the southern front façade is set back approximately 2'-0" behind the required front setback line, which provides slight modulation. Several balconies at the second story will create modulation at the principal building and is adorned with wrought iron fences and pre-cast concrete balustrades in a natural finish.

Parking

As required by the Beverly Hills Municipal Code, two parking spaces are required for the four-bedroom project. Parking is provided at the southern elevation adjacent to the residence under a porte cochere and is accessible from the driveway with the existing curb cut at Maple Drive. Each parking space measures 9'-0" wide by 19'-0" long as required by Code.

Design

The proposed design includes the following features:

- Two stories
- Terra Cotta colored clay tile roof
- Balconies with wrought iron railing and pre-cast concrete balustrades
- Wood windows and doors
- Pre-cast concrete molding surrounding windows and doors
- Recessed arch top entryway
- Smooth trowel stucco
- Wall at front property line with flat lighting sconce at pillars varies in height from 2'-0" to 3'-0" tall (shown on Sheet A-1)
- Porte cochere at south elevation

Materials

The materials and color proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Façade smooth trowel stucco finish – beige (at first story) and taupe color (at second story)
- Pre-cast concrete molding at front entryway arch, windows and door surrounds – natural color
- Wood windows and front entry door (mahogany color)
- Wrought iron railings and fence, brown color
- Wood roof corbels and eaves that project 1'-6" around the building

A material sample board will be available for the Commission's review at the meeting.

Paving

Less than 400 square feet of paving is proposed, which complies with Section 10-3-2422A of the BHMC. The hardscape for the site consists of a driveway approach nine feet wide (which will utilize an existing curb cut) and a five foot wide concrete walkway (not brick pavers as depicted in the site plan (sheet A.1) would lead to the residence.

Landscape Design

The proposed project will provide low-growing landscaping and grass ground cover in the front yard (consisting of New Zealand flax, roses, westringia and rosemary). Three King Palm trees (8-foot trunks) and two purple Orchid Trees (36" boxes) will be planted in the front yard. In last month's staff report, staff suggested a more appropriate tree be considered to better complement the design. Staff believes this issue should be discussed by the Commission as palm trees outgrow the initial design concept over time, and a more compatible maximum tree height would be more compatible with the proposed residence.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on August 24, 2009 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date, staff has not received any comments (written or oral) in regards to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed to be in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical

Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued (construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone).

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

The design of the residence has not substantially changed from the last Commission meeting, except for the removal of several windows and simplification of the façade. As a whole, the proposed design and architectural features exhibit several characteristics similar to those defined in the Design Catalogue for the Tuscan Villa residences.

As a result, staff's findings are unchanged from the previous staff report.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

Staff previously commented that the proposed façade provides slight modulation with the recessed entryway, balconies.

The proposed landscaping plan includes several palm trees and purple orchid trees at the front yard and a variety of low-growing plant materials that will enhance the garden quality of the city.

3. The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

The proposed project exhibits an internally compatible design scheme. The project utilizes several high quality building materials including stucco walls with wood window trims and doors, which will help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

Staff previously commented that the proposed project is not expected to create adverse impacts associated with the privacy of the neighbors. The proposed project meets the side setbacks required. The applicant will be providing a six-foot tall fence at the north and south property lines to provide privacy to the abutting neighbor. The provided (and required) side set back is 5'-0" at the north property line and 9'-0" for the first 38'-0" behind the front setback line at the south property line.

There will be several windows located on the second floor at the north elevation ranging from 3.5'-4'-0" tall by 2'-6" wide from two bedrooms and a bathroom. Additionally, there is a balcony at the rear of the property measuring 13'-6" wide by 6'-0" deep is setback 7'-0" from the northern property line.

At the south elevation, there are three small windows from two bedrooms and bathroom. A balcony measuring 4'-0" deep and 6'-9" wide is set at the required side yard setback (5'-0" from the property line). Additionally, there is a balcony at the rear of the property (east elevation) measuring 9'-7" deep by 21'-6" wide.

5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.

The properties along North Maple Drive are developed with structures varying in size and scale and there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern at present. A few new two-story residences built to the maximum floor area, along with existing one- and two-story residences, can be seen in the neighborhood. Therefore, it appears that the proposed development is in harmony with the old and new residences in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and re-submittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, Staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. The King Palm trees shall be replaced with a lower-growing species that is more compatible with an appropriate maximum height, and returned to staff for final review and approval.
2. Any approval by the Commission is for design only; the project is subject to all applicable City zoning regulations.
3. Any future modifications to this approval shall be presented to staff for a determination as to whether the change may be approved by staff (minor) or to the Commission for review. Changes made without City approval may be required to be restored to match the City approved plans.
4. Final plans shall include a color rendering of the front elevation with numbered call-outs and a corresponding legend for all proposed materials and finishes. Spec sheets for windows shall also be provided. This elevation will be used by staff for verification of materials at the project site during construction.
5. A copy of the final conditions of approval per the approved Resolution shall be scanned onto the cover sheet of the final building plans.



IVY NGUYEN
Assistant Planner



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
September 3, 2009
090005002 / PL 0930434

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Ivy Nguyen, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **306 North Maple Drive.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Bahram Raean, on behalf of the property owner, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow a new, two-story, four bedroom, 4,496 square foot single-family residence located at **306 North Maple Drive.**

Reason for Review by the Commission

Pursuant to Beverly Hills Municipal Code Section 10-3-4408, no single-family residence located in the Central R-1 zone shall be erected, constructed, altered or remodeled unless the elevations and plans for the exterior portions and areas visible from the street are reviewed and approved by the City. The Design Review Commission shall be the reviewing authority if it has first been determined that the design does not otherwise substantially adhere to a pure architectural style.

The applicant identifies the proposed project as "Tuscan Villa," however, the proposal does not strictly adhere to this pure architectural style. The proposed project exhibits the following that do not conform to a "Tuscan Villa" architectural style: prominent architectural moldings, asymmetrical façade, prominent balcony balustrades, and little differentiation between the sizes of the first and second floors.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the main house, accessory structure, and walls meet all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Bahram Raeen
Project Owner	Rabin Mizrahi
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – South of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	7,500 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is a rectangular-shaped lot that is 50'-0" wide by 150'-0" long lot, located on east side of the 300 block of North Maple Drive between Burton Way and Dayton Way. The existing one-story residence will be demolished in order to allow for the construction of the proposed project. The abutting properties at the north and south property lines are developed with two-story single-family residences. The streetscape is a mixture of new and existing residential homes, with no prominent architectural style present.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope

The proposed residence would have a total floor area of 4,496 square feet, which is slightly less than the maximum allowable building area (4,500 square feet) for the subject site. As proposed, the residence will be 24'-10" to the highest point of the roof (30'-0" maximum height for a building with a sloped roof is allowed as maximum plate height is 22'-0").

Modulation

The main entrance to the principal building contains a walkway with leading to the entryway door, with the main entry door set 3'-0" behind the required 25'-0" front yard setback. The first floor of the southern front façade is set back approximately 2'-0" behind the required front setback line, which provides slight modulation. Several

balconies at the second story will create modulation at the principal building and is adorned with wrought iron fences and pre-cast concrete balustrades in a natural finish.

Parking

As required by the Beverly Hills Municipal Code, two parking spaces are required for the four-bedroom project. Parking is provided at the southern elevation adjacent to the residence under a porte cochere and is accessible from the driveway with the existing curb cut at Maple Drive. Each parking space measures 9'-0" wide by 19'-0" long as required by Code.

Design

The proposed design of the structure includes the following features:

- Two stories
- Terra Cotta colored clay tile roof
- Balconies with wrought iron railing and pre-cast concrete balustrades
- Wood trim windows and doors
- Pre-cast concrete molding surrounding windows and doors
- Recessed arch top entryway
- Smooth trowel stucco at first story applied to facade to resemble stone work in beige color. The "stone work" will be applied to the front elevation. (Note: The rendering inaccurately depicts that the "stone work" is applied to the entire south elevation)
- Wall at front property line with flat lighting sconce at pillars varies in height from 2'-0" to 3'-0" tall (shown on Sheet A-1)
- Porte cochere at south elevation

Materials

The materials and color proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Façade smooth trowel stucco finish – beige (at first story) and taupe color (at second story)
- Pre-cast concrete molding at front entryway arch, windows and door surrounds – natural color
- Wood windows and front entry door (mahogany color)
- Wrought iron railings and fence, brown color
- Wood roof corbels and eaves that project 1'-6" around the building

A material sample board will be available for the Commission's review at the meeting.

Paving

The applicant had proposed less than 400 square feet of paving as permitted in Section 10-3-2422A of the BHMC. The hardscape for the site consists of a driveway approach nine feet wide (which will utilize an existing curb cut) and a five feet wide walkway leading to the residence. The material will be of concrete, not of brick pavers as depicted in the site plan (sheet A.1).

Landscape Design

The proposed project will provide for low-growing landscaping and grass ground cover in the front yard (consisting of New Zealand flax, roses, westringia and rosemary). Additionally, three King Palm trees (8-foot trunks) and two purple Orchid Trees (36" boxes) will be planted in the front yard.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on August 24, 2009 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date, staff has not received any comments (written or oral) in regards to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed to be in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued (construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone).

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

- 1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.***

The proposed design and architectural features exhibit several characteristics similar to those defined in the Design Catalogue for the Tuscan Villa residences. For example, recessed arched entryways and smooth light earth-toned stucco at the exterior surface can be found on the front facade. The balance of the proposed design appears to exhibit an internally compatible design scheme with several modifications.

However, the Commission may wish to discuss whether the proposed design may benefit from consistent window sizes and shapes, additional modulation, or alternatives to façade treatment at the front elevation.

2. *Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.*

The proposed design utilizes nearly the maximum amount of floor area permitted by the BHMC. The proposed height of the main residence is 24'-10" (maximum height allowed by Code is 30'-0" for a sloped roof) with a front façade that measures 35'-6" wide.

The proposed façade provides a degree of modulation as the entryway is set back 3'-0" behind required front setback of 25'-0". Additionally, the balcony at the southern portion of the second story of the front facade is inset by 1'-0" and roof eaves as previously discussed add slight modulation.

The proposed landscaping plan includes several palm trees and purple orchid trees at the front yard and a variety of low-growing plant materials that will enhance the garden quality of the city. However, the King Palms should be reconsidered and alternative trees should be selected to better complement the proposed residence.

3. *The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.*

The proposed project exhibits an internally compatible design scheme. The project utilizes several high quality building materials including stucco walls with wood window trims and doors, which will help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. *The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.*

The proposed project meets the side setbacks required. The applicant will be providing a six-foot tall fence at the north and south property lines to provide

privacy to the abutting neighbor. The provided (and required) side set back is 5'-0" at the north property line and 9'-0" for the first 38'-0" behind the front setback line at the south property line.

There will be several windows located on the second floor at the north elevation ranging from 3.5'-4'-0" tall by 2'-6" wide from two bedrooms and a bathroom. Additionally, there is a balcony at the rear of the property measuring 13'-6" wide by 6'-0" deep is setback 7'-0" from the northern property line.

At the south elevation, there are three small windows from two bedrooms and bathroom. A balcony measuring 4'-0" deep and 6'-9" wide is set at the required side yard setback (5'-0" from the property line). Additionally, there is a balcony at the rear of the property (east elevation) measuring 9'-7" deep by 21'-6" wide.

The Commission may wish to discuss whether the neighbors' privacy would benefit from additional landscaping at the north and south property lines.

Therefore, the proposed project may not create adverse impacts associated with privacy of neighbors provided that additional landscaping is proposed at the north and south property lines.

5. *The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.*

The properties along North Maple Drive are developed with structures varying in size and scale and there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern at present. A few new two-story residences built to the maximum floor area, along with existing one- and two-story residences, can be seen in the neighborhood. Therefore, it appears that the proposed development is in harmony with the old and new residences in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and re-submittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, Staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. Landscaping along the side property lines (north and south) shall be provided and maintained to ensure appropriate screening of the residence from abutting neighbors.
2. The applicant shall consider alternatives to the King Palm trees that will not outgrow the initial design.
3. Any approval by the Commission is for design only; the project is subject to all applicable City zoning regulations.
4. Final plans shall include specification sheets for windows and call-outs on a colored elevation for each material proposed for verification in the field during construction.
5. Any future modifications to this approval shall be presented to staff for a determination as to whether the change may be approved by staff (minor) or to the Commission for review.



IVY NGUYEN
Assistant Planner

