



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
January 12, 2009
PL0851709

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Georgana Millican, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **225 South Crescent Drive.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This project came before the Design Review Commission at the October 2, 2008 and the November 6, 2008 meeting. At the November 6, 2008 meeting, the Commission discussed the project and gave preliminary approval and requested a resolution approving the project with the following recommendations:

- Consider setting back the buttness for the porte cochere at least one foot;
- Reduce the width of the tile area in the fountain so it has a more vertical orientation and consider a different color for the tile background;
- Inset windows a minimum of six to eight inches (not the 12 inches previously suggested by staff);
- Increase the height of the entrance and/or the slope of the roof at the entrance as much as permitted by Code to give the entrance a more vertical orientation;
- Consider introducing a small porthole window above the entry door and possibly include colored leaded glass in keeping with the Spanish design;
- Reconsider the color at the shutters, entrance door, gate and windows;
- Provide information on the gutters and drainpipes;
- Consider using leader head in keeping with the traditional Spanish style.

The Applicant subsequently returned with revised plans to address some of the Commission's concerns. Specifically, the revised plans show:

- The buttress for the porte cochere was set back a foot.
- The fountain was reduced in width to be consistent with the arched doors on the first floor and the tile was changed to a turquoise blue.
- Windows are inset the six to eight inches as requested by the Commission.
- A small porthole window was added above the entry door. In addition, heavy molding was added around the entry door.

However, the following items were not addressed or revised:

- The roof height on the entrance is at the maximum allowed by Code so increasing the roof height was not a possibility.
- The color of the shutters, entrance door, gate and windows remains as proposed at the November 6, 2008 meeting.
- No information on the gutters, drainpipes or leader heads were provided to Staff. A condition of approval is that the gutters and leader heads be of a copper material and consistent with a traditional Spanish design. In addition, the Applicant must provide the information on the drainage gutters and leader heads for Staff review and approval prior to the issuance of the building permits.

A copy of the staff reports from the October 2, 2008 and the November 6, 2008 meetings are attached for reference.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Abe Kamara
Project Owner	Selena Rojhani & Mayer Dallal
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – South of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	6,050 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter

subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

As revised, the proposed design is consistent with a Spanish style with elements including arched window and front entry door, arched tiled fountain on the front elevation and sloped roof. The elements of the project appear balanced and to exhibit an internally compatible design.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

The proposed project has been designed to incorporate modulation including the upper second floor setback above the entry element and the second floor balcony. The maximum height of the house is shown as 28.5 feet while a maximum height of 30 feet is permitted. The lower roof height and the different planes on the façade help to reduce the appearance of scale and mass.

The landscaping plan has been well thought-out and would contribute to the garden quality of the city. The landscape plan was revised and the trees are now 36 inch box trees rather than the 24 inch boxes previously proposed. The larger box size is of a more mature size which enhances the garden like quality of the city. A condition of approval to minimize the appearance of scale and mass to the residence to the north is that the Applicant plant and maintain landscaping along the northern side property line extending to the rear of a species and size approved by Staff to provide screening.

3. The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

The proposed project is on a block that is primarily one-story, smaller, older homes of traditional styles. A few two-story homes are present on the street, however they are not immediately adjacent or across the street from the subject site. The revisions to the proposed design appear to minimize the appearance of scale and mass and enhance the internal compatibility of the design. As revised and with the recommended conditions of approval, the proposed residence would appear to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

- 4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.***

As proposed, the structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. The southern portion of the building is largely set back from the side property line due to a porte cochere. The proposed setback to the north is 5 feet, which meets the minimum setback requirement. The use of code required and increased setbacks, along with minimal window and door openings along the second floor, helps to create a balance between the reasonable expectation of development and the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

- 5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

The proposed project respects prevailing site design by using the existing driveway location and configuration to be consistent with the surrounding properties. The proposed project is a new two-story residence built in conformance with the current code requirements whereas the properties along South Crescent Drive are developed with structures that are primarily one-story and smaller in scale than the existing proposal which is close to the maximum allowable floor area for the site. The most common style of architecture found along South Crescent Drive can be identified as Spanish Mission Revival, but there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern at this point. The proposed design has elements of a Spanish style of architecture so, in terms of design style, it could be a harmonious addition to the neighborhood.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends that the Design Review Commission adopt the Resolution conditionally approving the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. The project shall be built in substantial conformance with the plans reviewed and approved by the Design Review Commission at their January 12, 2009 meeting.
2. The landscaping plan shall specify tree box sizes of a minimum 36" box.

3. The Applicant shall plant and maintain landscaping along the northern side property line extending to the rear of a species and size approved by Staff to provide screening. A revised landscaping plan with this information shall be reviewed and approved by Staff prior to the issuance of building permits.
4. The drainage gutters and leader heads shall be of a copper material and consistent with a traditional Spanish design. In addition, the Applicant must provide the information on the drainage gutters and leader heads for Staff review and approval prior to the issuance of the building permits



Georgana Millican
Associate Planner

Attachments:
Draft Resolution
Staff Report – November 6, 2008
Staff Report – October 2, 2008

RESOLUTION NO.

RESOLUTION OF THE DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS CONDITIONALLY APPROVING AN R-1 DESIGN REVIEW PERMIT TO ALLOW A NEW TWO-STORY SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENCE AT PROPERTY LOCATED IN THE CENTRAL AREA OF THE CITY, SOUTH OF SANTA MONICA BOULEVARD AT 225 SOUTH CRESCENT DRIVE.

The Design Review Commission of the City of Beverly Hills hereby finds, resolves and determines as follows:

Section 1. Abe Kamara, on behalf of the property owners Selena Rojhani and Mayer Dallal (collectively, the "Applicant"), has applied for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard, at 225 South Crescent Drive (the "Project"). As proposed, the Project meets all required zoning standards, including height, setbacks, parking and floor area.

Pursuant to Beverly Hills Municipal Code Section 10-3-4408, no single-family residence located in a Central R-1 Zone shall be erected, constructed, altered or remodeled unless the elevations and plans for the exterior portions and areas visible from the street are reviewed and approved by the City. The Design Review Commission is the reviewing authority if it has first been determined that the design does not otherwise qualify for a staff-level review of the proposed project. The design was prepared by a licensed architect, but did not substantially conform to a pure architectural style. Therefore, it was determined that the Design Review Commission shall be the reviewing authority.

Pursuant to Beverly Hills Municipal Code Section 10-3-4415, the request for a Design Review Permit may be approved, provided the Design Review Commission makes certain findings.

Section 2. The Project site averages 50 feet wide by 121.4 feet long, and is located on the west side of the 200 block of South Crescent Drive, between Charleville Boulevard and Gregory Way. The lot is currently developed with a one-story residence and

detached garage. The existing residence and detached garage will be demolished, and replaced with a new, two-story single family residence and porte cochere. The surrounding development is characterized by one and two-story single family homes.

The proposed residence would have a square footage of 3,915 square feet which is just under the maximum allowed floor area for the site of 3,920 square feet. The first floor entry element is located at the required front yard setback while the rest of the building is set back an additional one foot. The second floor area above the entry is set back 7.5 feet from the ground floor and the upper balcony is set back 6.5 feet from the second floor elevation. The Project meets the minimum side setbacks allowed for the house, 9 feet to the south and 5 feet to the north, so the façade of the proposed residence meets the maximum width allowed by Code. The proposed height to the top of the roof is 28 feet, which is two feet less than the maximum allowed by Code (30 feet).

Parking for the proposed Project will be provided within the side yard and on a cement pad located at the rear of the property. The house has a porte cochere, which will provide one covered parking space within the side yard. The total number of parking spaces provided is three, which meets the number of spaces required by Code. New paving within the front yard has been proposed as a part of the landscaping plan. The total area of paved surface within the front yard is 380 square feet, 400 square feet is the maximum allowed by Code.

A detailed landscaping plan for the Project has been prepared which proposes a variety of landscaping which helps to create a lush, garden-like atmosphere. Some of the trees species located within the front yard include six Pigmy Date Palms, four Flowering Plum trees and two Sago Palm trees.

This Project came before the Design Review Commission at its meetings of October 2, 2008 and November 6, 2008. At its meeting of October 2, 2008 the Commission requested numerous design changes and returned the Project for restudy. At the meeting of November 6, 2008, the Applicant returned with revised plans that incorporated design changes requested by the Commission, and the Commission approved the Project, subject to the following conditions:

1. Set back the buttress for the porte cochere at least one foot;
2. Reduce the width of the tile area in the fountain so it has a more vertical orientation and consider a different color for the tile background;

3. Inset windows a minimum of six to eight inches;
4. Increase the height of the entrance and/or the slope of the roof at the entrance as much as permitted by Code to give the entrance a more vertical orientation;
5. Consider introducing a small porthole window above the entry door and possibly include colored leaded glass in keeping with the Spanish design;
6. Reconsider the color at the shutters, entrance door, gate and windows;
7. Provide information on the gutters and drainpipes;
8. Consider using leader head in keeping with the traditional Spanish style.

The Applicant has revised the Project to respond to the Commission's concerns. The revisions are as follows:

1. The roof height on the entrance is at the maximum allowed by Code so increasing the roof height was not a possibility.
2. The color of the shutters, entrance door, gate and windows remains as proposed at the November 6, 2008 meeting.
3. No information on the gutters, drainpipes or leader heads were provided to Staff. A condition of approval is that the gutters and leader heads be of a copper material and consistent with a traditional Spanish design. In addition, the Applicant must provide the information on the drainage gutters and leader heads for Staff review and approval prior to the issuance of the building permits.

Section 3. The Project has been environmentally reviewed pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the State CEQA Guidelines (California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Sections 15000 et seq, hereafter the "Guidelines"), and the City's environmental guidelines. The City has determined that the Project qualifies for a Class 2 Categorical Exemption (Replacement or Reconstruction) in accordance with the requirements of Section 15302 of the Guidelines because the Project involves the demolition of an existing single family residence, and reconstruction of a new single family residence on the same site and which

will have substantially the same purpose and capacity as the structure replaced. Therefore, no significant impacts to the environment are anticipated.

Section 4. On October 2, 2008 and November 6, 2008, the Design Review Commission held a duly noticed public hearing to consider the application. Evidence, both written and oral, was presented at said hearing, and the hearing was closed.

Section 5. In reviewing the application and pursuant to Beverly Hills Municipal Code Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission considered whether the proposed Project meets the following criteria:

1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.
2. The proposed development's design appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass and enhances the garden like quality of the City and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.
3. The proposed development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.
4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.
5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design patterns, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new homes.

Section 6. Based upon the evidence presented at the hearing, including the staff report, the Design Review Commission hereby finds:

1. As conditioned, the Project exhibits a design that is consistent with a Spanish style with elements including arched windows and front entry door, arched tile fountain on the front elevation and sloped roof. The elements of the project appear balanced and to exhibit an internally compatible design.
2. As conditioned, the Project appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass because it has been designed to incorporate modulation including the upper second

floor setback above the entry element and the second floor balcony. The maximum height of the house is shown as 28.5 feet while a maximum height of 30 feet is permitted. The lower roof height and different planes on the façade help to reduce the appearance of scale and mass.

The landscaping plan has been well thought-out and would contribute to the garden quality of the city. The Project, as conditioned, includes appropriate façade modulation and proposes new landscaping, specifically throughout the front and rear yards. The Project enhances the garden like quality of the City and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

3. As conditioned, the Project will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood as a result of the revisions made to the design as discussed under Section 2 of this Resolution and as a result of the Project's use of quality materials, modulation and landscaping as discussed under paragraph 2 of this Section.

4. As conditioned, the Project is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors. The subject site abuts other single-family residential properties and proposes a five-foot setback to the north and a nine-foot setback to the south. The north and south elevations utilize a minimal amount of windows and doors, respecting the privacy of adjacent properties, and is therefore not anticipated to create an adverse impact on privacy.

5. As conditioned, the Project, with the revisions and features described above, respects prevailing site design pattern and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new homes. Although the properties along South Crescent Drive do not appear to follow a consistent design pattern at this point, the predominant architectural style in the area tends to be Spanish Mission Revival, and the proposed design follows the Spanish Mission Revival style, the design does use building materials and architectural elements common to the Spanish Mission Revival style that would appropriately conform to the surrounding area's characteristics.

Section 7. Based on the foregoing, the Design Review Commission hereby grants the R-1 Design Review Permit for the Project, subject to the following conditions:

1. The project shall be built in substantial conformance with the plans reviewed and approved by the Design Review Commission at their January 12, 2009 meeting.

2. The landscaping plan shall specify tree box sizes of a minimum 36" box.
3. The Applicant shall plant and maintain landscaping along the northern side property line extending to the rear of a species and size approved by Staff to provide screening. A revised landscaping plan with this information shall be reviewed and approved by Staff prior to the issuance of building permits.
4. The drainage gutters and leader heads shall be of a copper material and consistent with a traditional Spanish design. In addition, the Applicant must provide the information on the drainage gutters and leader heads for Staff review and approval prior to the issuance of the building permits

Standard Conditions:

5. Prior to the issuance of building permits, the Applicant shall prepare a construction management plan for review and approval by the Department of Community Development. The plan shall include the location of construction parking, loading and hauling routes and locations, and number of construction employees anticipated on site. All construction-related parking, staging and hauling shall conform to the construction parking and hauling plan submitted to and approved by the Building Official and the City Engineer.

6. The Applicant shall maintain the site in an orderly condition prior to commencement of and during construction, including, but not limited to, maintenance of the orderly appearance of existing structures and landscaping on the site, dust suppression for areas cleared by demolition, maintenance of safety barriers and adjacent public sidewalks, and provision of a contact person directly accessible to the public by telephone in the event that the public has any concerns regarding maintenance of the site. The name and telephone number of the contact person shall be transmitted to the Director of Community Development and the Building Official. In addition, the Applicant shall post the name and telephone number of the contact person on the site in a location readily visible to the general public and approved by the Director of Community Development.

7. These conditions of approval shall run with the land and shall remain in full force and effect for the duration of the life of this approval. This resolution approving the R-1 Design Review Permit shall not become effective until the owner of the Project site records a covenant, satisfactory in form and content to the City Attorney, accepting the conditions of

approval set forth in this resolution. The covenant shall include a copy of this resolution as an exhibit.

The Applicant shall deliver the executed covenant to the Department of Community Development **within 60 days** of the Design Review Commission decision. At the time that the Applicant delivers the covenant to the City, the Applicant shall also provide the City with all fees necessary to record the document with the County Recorder. If the Applicant fails to deliver the executed covenant within the required 60 days, this resolution approving the R-1 Design Review **shall be null and void** and of no further effect. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the director of Community Development may, upon a request by the Applicant, grant a waiver from the 60-day time limit if, at the time of the request, the Director determines that there have been no substantial changes to any federal, state or local law that would affect the R-1 Design Review.

Section 8. The Secretary of the Design Review Commission shall certify to the passage, approval, and adoption of this resolution, and shall cause this resolution and certification to be entered in the Book of Resolutions of the Design review Commission of the City.

Adopted:

Howard Szabo
Chair of the Design Review
Commission of the City of Beverly Hills,
California

Attest:

Secretary

Approved as to form:

Approved as to content:

David M. Snow
Assistant City Attorney

Jonathan Lait, AICP *JL*
City Planner



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
November 6, 2008
PL0851709

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Georgana Millican, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **225 South Crescent Drive.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This project came before the Design Review Commission at the October 2, 2008 meeting. At the meeting, the Commission discussed the project and requested that the project return for restudy with the following guidance:

- Design needs to be consistent with a pure style;
- Concern that the stucco surround on the entry element was too large;
- Revise trellis element;
- Side elevations were too plain.
- Revise the proportions of the glass on the French doors;
- Increase the box size of the trees from 24 inches to 36 inches.

The Applicant subsequently returned with revised plans to address the Commission's concerns. Specifically, the revised plans show:

- Removed the stone entry element and added a new one-story arched entry element with three arched windows above on the second floor;
- Revised the French doors on the ground floor to arched doors;
- Removed the trellis element and replaced it with an inset arched fountain with tile background;
- Set back the majority of the façade a foot from the required front yard setback. As proposed only the entry element is at the setback line;
- Removed the second floor balcony encroachment into the required front yard setback.
- Carried the first floor entry element roof line along the side elevation and added three arched windows both on the upper and ground floor on the side elevation.

A copy of the staff report from the October 2, 2008 meeting is attached for reference.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Abe Kamara
Project Owner	Selena Rojhani & Mayer Dallal
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – South of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	6,050 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope/Modulation

The proposed house and garage would have a total floor area of 3,915 square feet, slightly under the maximum allowable building area (3,920 square feet) for the subject site. The first floor entry element is located at the required front yard setback while the rest of the building is set back an additional one foot. The second floor area above the entry is set back 7.5 feet from the ground floor entry element and the upper balcony is set back 6.5 feet from the second floor elevation.

Revised Materials

The materials proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Smooth trowel stucco in “Flaxen”
- Corbels and eaves in a color called “Muddy Tide”
- Windows and doors made of wood painted in “Muddy Tide”

- Clay roof tiles
- Iron work – “Evening Brass” in color.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. The proposed development’s design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

As revised, the proposed design is consistent with a Spanish style. The elements of the project appear balanced and to exhibit an internally compatible design. A recommended condition of approval is to inset the windows a minimum of 12 inches (12”) to add to the articulation of the design.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

The proposed project has been designed to incorporate modulation including the upper second floor setback above the entry element and the second floor balcony. The maximum height of the house is shown as 28.5 feet while a maximum height of 30 feet is permitted. The lower roof height and the different planes on the façade help to reduce the appearance of scale and mass. Staff is recommending that all the windows be inset a minimum of twelve inches (12”) to add to the articulation of the design.

The landscaping plan has been well thought-out and would contribute to the garden quality of the city; however, the trees proposed for use on the subject site have been called out as 24” box trees. A 24” box is typically not considered to be a mature size, therefore a condition of approval is that the tree box size be a minimum of 36 inches (36”).

3. The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

The proposed project is on a block that is primarily one-story, smaller, older homes of traditional styles. A few two-story homes are present on the street, however they are not immediately adjacent or across the street from the subject site. The revisions to the proposed design appear to minimize the appearance of scale and mass and enhance the internal compatibility of the design. As revised and with the recommended conditions of approval, the proposed residence would appear to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

As proposed, the structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. The southern portion of the building is largely set back from the side property line due to a porte cochere. The proposed setback to the north is 5 feet, which meets the minimum setback requirement. The use of code required and increased setbacks, along with minimal window and door openings along the second floor, helps to create a balance between the reasonable expectation of development and the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.

The proposed project respects prevailing site design by using the existing driveway location and configuration to be consistent with the surrounding properties. The proposed project is a new two-story residence built in conformance with the current code requirements whereas the properties along South Crescent Drive are developed with structures that are primarily one-story and smaller in scale than the existing proposal which is close to the maximum allowable floor area for the site. The most common style of architecture found along S. Crescent Drive can be identified as Spanish Mission Revival, but there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern at this point. The proposed design has elements of a Spanish style of architecture so, in terms of design style, it could be a harmonious addition to the neighborhood.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;

3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and resubmittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends that the Design Review Commission approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. The 24" box trees proposed for use in the landscaping plan shall be increased in size to a minimum 36" box.
2. The windows shall be inset a minimum of twelve inches (12").

Georgana Millican
Associate Planner



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
October 2, 2008
PL0851709

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Georgana Millican, Associate Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **225 South Crescent Drive.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Abe Kamara of AMT ENT. Inc., on behalf of the property owner, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow the construction of a new single-family residence at **225 South Crescent Drive.**

Reason for Review by the Commission

The proposed project may not substantially conform to a single, pure architectural style; therefore, the proposal is brought before the Design Review Commission for review as a Track 2 application.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the design meets required zoning standards such as height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements. As conditioned, the proposed project meets all zoning requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Abe Kamara
Project Owner	Selena Rojhani & Mayer Dallal
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – South of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	6,050 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is approximately 50-feet wide by 121.4 feet long, located on the west side of the 200 block of South Crescent Drive between Charleville Boulevard and Gregory Way. The lot is currently developed with a single-story residence and detached garage. The existing primary residence and garage would be demolished and replaced by a new two-story residence and porte cochere. Surrounding development consists of one- and two-story single-family homes.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope/Modulation

The proposed house and garage would have a total floor area of 3,907 square feet, slightly under the maximum allowable building area (3,920 square feet) for the subject site.

As proposed, the residence has a sloped roof with a total height of approximately 28 feet to the highest point of the roof. The main entrance to the proposed structure is on the northern portion of the façade, set back 1.5 feet, within a tower entry element. Additional access has been provided at the front of the structure with French doors. The façade also includes two arched areas that are inset in the façade with a landscape trellis within each. Above the arched area is a second floor balcony that extends into the front yard setback by 2.5 feet as permitted by BHMC 10-3-2408. The entry door is a single wood arched door. The center of the second floor with the balcony is set back two feet providing some façade modulation along with the curved entry tower feature.

Parking

As required by the BHMC, a total of three parking spaces behind the front yard setback have been proposed in conjunction with the new house. The proposed parking will be provided by a porte cochere and the driveway that runs along the side of the house and an additional one car parking pad accessed off of the alley. No garage is proposed on the subject site at this time.

Design

The project's designer has stated that the style of architecture is Spanish.

Materials

The materials proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Smooth trowel stucco in white
- Trim in a color called "Epre Rust"
- Windows and doors made of wood painted in "Evening Brass"
- Stone veneer – Sawtooth Rustic Ledge
- Clay roof tiles
- Iron work – "Summerstorm" in color.

Paving:

The total amount of paving permitted within the front yard of the subject site is 400 square feet. The proposed project includes a total of 380 square feet of concrete paving within the front yard for the driveway and a front walkway. A front yard wall is shown on the landscape plan and the rendering, however the Applicant has stated this is to be removed.

Landscape Design:

A variety of landscaping has been proposed throughout the subject site, which will help to create a lush, garden-like atmosphere. Some of the tree species located within the front yard include six Pigmy Date Palms, four Flowering Plum trees and two Sago Palm trees. Although the landscaping has been well thought out, the largest trees proposed would be in a 24" box, which is normally not considered to be the size of a mature tree. Typically, mature landscaping is desirable when installed in conjunction with a new house, and it may be necessary to provide larger, more mature landscaping in conjunction with the proposed project.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on September 22, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date staff has not received any comments in regard to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

The proposed project does not appear to exhibit an internally compatible design. The design is not strictly Spanish in style but rather has elements of various rural European styles along with more contemporary elements. The Commission may wish to discuss the various design elements including the arched inset areas with the trellis and vines, the large second floor balcony extending into the front yard setback and the tower entry element with the stone veneer. The façade design is not evident in the side elevations which appear plain and lack modulation. The proposed project utilizes various building materials including wood doors and windows, smooth stucco and a synthetic stone veneer for the entry tower element. The Commission may wish to discuss whether the proposed stone is appropriate and whether white stucco is harmonious with the color of the proposed stone (samples to be shown at the meeting).

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

The proposed project has been designed to incorporate some modulation including the tower entry element and the second floor two-foot setback in the area of the balcony. However the balcony does extend 2.5 feet into the required front yard setback which does add some additional mass to the façade. The Commission may wish to discuss whether setting the balcony back behind the front yard setback would further minimize the appearance of scale and mass. The maximum height of the house is shown as 28.5 feet while a maximum height of 30 feet is permitted. The lower roof height does help to reduce the appearance of scale and mass.

The landscaping plan has been well thought-out and would contribute to the garden quality of the city; however, the trees proposed for use on the subject site have been called out as 24" box trees. A 24" box is typically not considered to be a mature size, and the Commission may wish to require the use of a larger tree size.

3. *The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.*

Pursuant to the findings under the criteria above, staff has concerns that the proposed design lacks an internally compatible style and could use some additional setbacks so that it will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood. A detailed landscaping plan has been submitted in conjunction with the proposed residence, which will help to screen and enhance the proposed residence. The proposed project is on a block that is primarily one-story, smaller, older homes of traditional styles. A few two-story homes are present on the street, however they are not immediately adjacent or across the street from the subject site. As the block currently exists, the proposed design does not appear that it would be of appropriate scale to the surrounding residences.

4. *The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.*

As proposed, the structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. The southern portion of the building is largely set back from the side property line due to a porte cochere. The proposed setback to the north is 5 feet, which meets the minimum setback requirement. The use of code required and increased setbacks, along with minimal window and door openings along the second floor, helps to create a balance between the reasonable expectation of development and the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

5. *The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.*

The proposed project respects prevailing site design by using the existing driveway location and configuration to be consistent with the surrounding properties. The proposed project is a new two-story residence built in conformance with the current code requirements whereas the properties along South Crescent Drive are developed with structures that are primarily one-story and smaller in scale than the existing proposal which is close to the maximum allowable floor area for the site. The most common style of architecture found along S. Crescent Drive can be identified as Spanish Mission Revival, but there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern

at this point. The proposed design has elements of a Spanish style of architecture so, in terms of design style, it could be a harmonious addition to the neighborhood.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and resubmittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. The 24" box trees proposed for use in the landscaping plan shall be increased in size to a 48" box.
2. The front yard wall shown on the plans shall be removed.
3. The front balcony shall be reduced in size.
4. Some additional design details or modulation shall be added to the side elevations to break up the mass and create a more integrated design.

Georgana Millican
Associate Planner