



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
November 6, 2008
PL 0815082

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Masa Alkire, Consulting Planner

SUBJECT: A request for final approval of a R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at 603 N. Linden Drive.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Brian Lerman of ARC Design Group, on behalf of the property owners, Asher and Daphna Bartov, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow the construction of a new single-family residence at 603 N. Linden Drive.

This application was initially reviewed by the Design Review Commission at its September 4, 2008 meeting. Preliminary approval of the Design Review Permit was granted by the Commission on October 2, 2008. The applicant has revised the plans based on the comments of the Commission at its October meeting and is now seeking final approval.

FINAL REVISIONS

The following table identifies concerns raised by the Commission and the applicant's response to these concerns:

| <u>COMMISSION COMMENT</u> | <u>APPLICANT REVISION</u> |
|---|---|
| <i>The strip between the windows on the round elements is too narrow.</i> | The radius on top of each window on the round elements has been altered to a segmented arch and each window is reduced by 3" in width to create greater |

| | |
|---|--|
| | spacing between the windows on the lower round element. The second floor round element has had one window removed to create greater spacing. |
| <i>Additional Detailing is necessary.</i> | A molding at the top of the windows on the round elements has been added. |
| <i>A more generous gap between roof-line and windows is needed.</i> | Windows have been lowered an additional four inches. |
| <i>Arches on the second story balcony need work.</i> | The arches on the second floor balcony have been modified. |

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on August 25, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date staff has not received any comments regarding this design review application.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

- 1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.***

The proposed design is inspired by the villas located along the French Riviera. The features of the proposed structure are consistent with the submitted reference materials. The prominent tile roof, color palette, shuttered windows, recessed entryway and asymmetry of roof line are all features that are prominent on the submitted reference materials. In addition, the applicant's modified design has increased the number of uniform, shuttered windows along the front façade, a design feature typical to the villas of France.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

Although the structure contains the maximum floor area allowed by code the proposed design has features that minimize the appearance of scale and mass. The front façade is articulated at varying distances behind the required 35-foot front setback line, the front elevation has both one and two story rooflines. The front façade also includes an inset entryway and covered porch that both provide depth and variation along the street-facing façade. The submitted landscaping plans includes a detailed planting palette and hardscape information. The resubmitted design has increased the amount of planting in front the proposed structure and maintained an existing Sycamore tree located in the front yard. The revised project will contribute to the garden-like quality of the City.

3. The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

As discussed in criteria one and two, the proposed residence has an internally compatible design scheme and has articulation and varying rooflines to mitigate the appearance and scale and mass. These design characteristics should result in a residence that contributes to the enhanced appearance of the neighborhood. In addition, the project as proposed is utilizing high quality building materials. The use of high quality materials will also help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

As proposed, the structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. Existing fencing and walls will be maintained or replaced to provide privacy for directly adjacent neighbors. The revised plans have removed an exterior staircase access to the proposed balcony. Removal of this feature reduces potential privacy impacts on the directly adjacent neighbor. The design appears to balance the reasonable expectation of privacy with to owner's rights to build.

- 5. *The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

The properties along North Linden Drive are located on relatively large single family lots and are developed with large single family homes that vary in age and style. The construction of a new residence would be consistent with the varied character of the surrounding homes. The proposed design manages to maximize floor area without appearing unduly massive and bulky and so would be a harmonious addition to the existing neighborhood.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Given final approval of the plans as presented;
2. Approve the final plans subject to additional conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission grant final approval to the project. A resolution approving the project would be provided at the December 4, 2008 meeting.


Masa Alkire
Associate Planner



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
October 2, 2008
PL 0815082

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Masa Alkire, Consulting Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at **603 N. Linden Drive.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Brian Lerman of ARC Design Group, on behalf of the property owners, Asher and Daphna Bartov, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow the construction of a new single-family residence at **603 N. Linden Drive.**

This application was initially reviewed by the Design Review Commission at its September 4, 2008 meeting. The Commission directed the applicant to restudy and revise the project. The Commission's primary issue was consistency of design for the proposed residence.

The proposed residential development does not adhere to a pure architectural style as outlined in the City's style catalogue and is therefore subject to review by the Design Review Commission. The applicant has identified that the project is inspired by the villas located on the French Riviera.

REVISED CHARACTERISTICS

The general comment of the Design Review Commission is that there be a consistent design idea throughout the house and more harmony is needed in the design.

The following table identifies concerns raised by the Commission and the applicant's response to these concerns:

| <u>COMMISSION COMMENT</u> | <u>APPLICANT REVISION</u> |
|---|---|
| <i>Maximize the roof overhang. Consider a reduction in roof pitch to maximize the overhang.</i> | Roof eaves have been increased to 18" on the new plan. However, the gutters on the side yard elevations are identified as an additional 6" beyond the 18" side setback encroachment allowed. The sideyard eaves and gutters will need to be revised on the final plans to the 18" max. allowed by code. Roof pitch has been reduced 5:12 to 4:12. |
| <i>Consistent fenestration is necessary.</i> | A consistent size of rectangular windows is used across the front façade. On the second story, the proposed glass doorway to a porch has been replaced with rectangular windows. The second floor opening above the front doorway has been modified into a functional enclosed porch. The windows on the round building elements have been consistently modified to have arched tops. |
| <i>The scale of the shutters is not correct. The shutters should match the size of the window and look operable.</i> | The shutters of the rectangular windows have been re-sized to match the width of the windows. |
| <i>There should be separation of the second floor windows and the roofline.</i> | The rectangular windows that replace the porch doors have a greater separation from the roofline than the original proposal. The arched tops to the windows located on the second story round component creates a larger separation from the roofline than the original proposal. |
| <i>The entryway door should be simplified.</i> | The decorative elements integrated into the transom window have been removed. |
| <i>The Sycamore tree in front yard needs to be evaluated as a heritage tree. The tree could be removed if replaced with significant vegetation.</i> | The applicant is no longer proposing to remove the large existing Sycamore tree located in the front yard. |
| <i>The proposed landscaping should be enhanced.</i> | The planting bed in front of the front bay window has been expanded. The paving leading to the not required side parking space has been reconfigured to allow for easier access. Small screening hedges have been |

| | |
|--|--|
| | added to the sides of the driveway. |
| <i>Screening for backyard privacy, such as the addition of a tall hedge at the side property line.</i> | The applicant has reduced privacy concerns in the rear yard by removing an exterior stairway to the rear deck. An existing 6 foot tall wood fence on the north property line will be replaced by a 6 foot tall wall plastered to match the residence. The existing neighbors wall screens the south side yard. |
| <i>Modify the garage door as it is a prominent element of the front façade.</i> | The garage doors have been modified to a more decorative carriage style garage door. |

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on August 25, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date staff has not received any comments regarding this design review application.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

- 1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.***

The proposed design is inspired by the villas located along the French Riviera. The features of the proposed structure are consistent with the submitted reference

materials. The prominent tile roof, color palette, shuttered windows, recessed entryway and asymmetry of roof line are all features that are prominent on the submitted reference materials. In addition, the applicant's modified design has increased the number of uniform, shuttered windows along the front façade, a design feature typical to the villas of France.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

Although the structure contains the maximum floor area allowed by code the proposed design has features that minimize the appearance of scale and mass. The front façade is articulated at varying distances behind the required 35-foot front setback line, the front elevation has both one and two story rooflines. The front façade also includes an inset entryway and covered porch that both provide depth and variation along the street-facing façade. The submitted landscaping plans includes a detailed planting palette and hardscape information. The resubmitted design has increased the amount of planting in front the proposed structure and maintained an existing Sycamore tree located in the front yard. The revised project will contribute to the garden-like quality of the City.

3. The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

As discussed in criteria one and two, the proposed residence has an internally compatible design scheme and has articulation and varying rooflines to mitigate the appearance and scale and mass. These design characteristics should result in a residence that contributes to the enhanced appearance of the neighborhood. In addition, the project as proposed is utilizing high quality building materials. The use of high quality materials will also help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

As proposed, the structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. Existing fencing and walls will be maintained or replaced to provide privacy for directly adjacent neighbors. The revised plans have removed an exterior staircase access to the proposed balcony. Removal of this feature reduces potential privacy impacts on the directly adjacent neighbor. The design appears to balance the reasonable expectation of privacy with to owner's rights to build.

5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.

The properties along North Linden Drive are located on relatively large single family lots and are developed with large single family homes that vary in age and style. The construction of a new residence would be consistent with the varied character of the surrounding homes. The proposed design manages to maximize floor area without appearing unduly massive and bulky and so would be a harmonious addition to the existing neighborhood.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and resubmittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following condition and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. The sideyard eaves and gutters extend no more than 18 inches into the required sideyards.

MASA ALKIRE
Consulting Planner



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
September 4, 2008
PL 0815082

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Masa Alkire, Consulting Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at **603 N. Linden Drive.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Brian Lerman of ARC Design Group, on behalf of the property owners, Asher and Daphna Bartov, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow the construction of a new single-family residence at **603 N. Linden Drive.**

Reason for Review by the Commission

The proposed residential development does not adhere to a pure architectural style as outlined in the City's style catalogue. The applicant has identified that the project is in the style of a French Riviera Villa.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the design meets required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements. One zoning correction is required on the submitted plans, an opaque wall or hedge 2 to 3 feet high is required along the sides of the proposed driveway. The project received a minor accommodation permit on July 16, 2008 to allow a maximum height of 32 feet with an average height of less than 28 feet.

| GENERAL INFORMATION | |
|----------------------------|--|
| Applicant | ARC Design Group |
| Project Owner | Asher and Daphna Bartov |
| Zoning District | Central R-1 Area – North of Santa Monica Boulevard |

| | |
|---|--------------|
| Parcel Size | 11, 510 s.f. |
| Listed in City's Historic Survey | No |

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is approximately 80-feet wide by 144-feet long lot (lot average width and length), located on the west side of the 600 block of N. Linden Drive Drive between Carmelita and Elevado Avenues and is surrounded by residential development that is characterized by one and two-story homes along both sides of the block. The property is developed with an existing two-story single-family home. According to Los Angeles County records the existing single family residence was originally constructed in 1925. The property is not identified in the City's Historic Resources Survey.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope/Modulation

The proposed project is a 6,101 square foot two-story single family residence., The proposed residence is just under the maximum allowable building area (6,104 square feet) for the subject site. The single family home currently located on the property is proposed to be demolished to facilitate the construction of the new residence.

As proposed, the maximum height of the proposed residence is 32 feet, with an average roof height of less than 28 feet in height. The applicant has received a minor accommodation permit from the City to allow the 32 foot building height. The project meets the Code required side setbacks of 18 feet cumulative for an 80 foot wide lot. The main entrance to the proposed structure consists of a recessed entryway leading to a prominent custom wood door (applicant will have additional detail information at the meeting). The front façade is articulated with all portions of the façade located behind the required front setback line. The covered porch entryway is 5.5 feet behind the required front setback and the garage entrance is 4 feet behind the setback. The rounded 1st story piano alcove projects to the required front setback line. There is a mix of one and two story roof elevations along the front elevation, with an enclosed porch located on the second story.

Parking

As required by the BHMC, a total of two parking spaces behind the front yard setback have been proposed in conjunction with the new house. The proposed parking will be provided in an attached garage.

Design

The applicant has identified the structure as a "French Riviera Villa". Reference photos of villas from that region were submitted to the Planning Division to identify the

inspiration for the submitted design. The photos will be available for the Commission's review at the hearing. The submitted design appears to have similar characteristics as the reference photos. These include:

- Prominent variegated tile roof with overhanging roof eaves
- Asymmetry in the placement of rooflines windows and balconies
- Recessed entryways
- Pastel color palette with white trim at windows and entryways
- Numerous inset window openings of both arched and rectangular shapes
- Window shutters
- Decorative railings and features at balconies and porches.

Materials

The materials and color proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Stucco –smooth finish painted - "western sand"
- Precast by Fine Line (example available at meeting) - painted white
- Roof – Redland Clay tile - mix of "buff, café antigua, palmilla and peach"
- Wood French doors and windows - "ultra pure white"
- Shutters and wood fencing - "hollingsworth green"
- Decorative railings and site fencing- "brilliant white"
- Front door – Solid wood painted white.

Paving:

The total amount of paving permitted within the front yard of the subject site is 33% of the area of the front yard. The front yard is 2800 square feet in size. The applicant is proposing 33% or 927 square feet be paved.

Landscape Design:

The project includes new landscaping and site improvements, including a new pool and spa. The applicant has indicated that the project's landscape architect will be available at the meeting to discuss the project. The landscape plan includes: a flagstone driveway, a stone entry path and low 18" high stone entry walls bordering the pathway in the front yard. Turf areas are proposed for the front yard. Some existing trees will be removed with another existing tree to remain in the front yard. The second landscape sheet outlines the proposed planting materials.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on August 25, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date staff has not received any comments regarding the project.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

The proposed design is indicated as French Riviera Villa. The features of the proposed structure are consistent with the submitted reference materials. The prominent tile roof, color palette, shuttered windows, recessed entryway and asymmetry of roof line are all features that are prominent on the submitted reference materials.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

Although the structure contains the maximum floor area allowed by code the proposed design has features that minimize the appearance of scale and mass. The front façade is articulated at varying distances behind the required 35-foot front setback line, the front elevation has both one and two story rooflines. The front façade also includes an inset entryway and covered porch that both provide depth and variation along the street-facing façade. The submitted landscaping plans including a detailed planting palette and hardscape information has been provided, is necessary to ensure the project contributes to the garden-like quality of the City.

3. The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

As discussed in criteria one and two, the proposed residence has an internally compatible design scheme and has articulation and varying rooflines to mitigate the appearance and scale and mass. These design characteristics should result in a residence that contributes to the enhanced appearance of the neighborhood. In

addition, the project as proposed is utilizing high quality building materials. The use of high quality materials will also help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

- 4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.***

As proposed, the structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. However the location of an exterior staircase to the second story rear balcony could potentially lead to privacy concerns with the neighbor directly abutting to the south. The Commission may wish to discuss, shielding, orientation or location solutions to this potential impact. Other than exterior access location, the design appears to balance the reasonable expectation of privacy with to owner's rights to build.

- 5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

The properties along North Linden Drive are located on relatively large single family lots and are developed with large single family homes that vary in age and style. The construction of a new residence would be consistent with the varied character of the surrounding homes. The proposed design manages to maximize floor area without appearing unduly massive and bulky and so would be a harmonious addition to the existing neighborhood.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and resubmittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission either

provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. The exterior staircase be reconfigured or relocated to ensure privacy to the directly adjacent neighbor to the south.
2. The front yard paving be reconfigured to allow for one additional uncovered space in the north sideyard to ensure adequate parking for the residence behind the required front yard setback. The reconfigured parking areas are required to be bordered by a two to three foot tall wall or hedge.

MASA ALKIRE
Consulting Planner