



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
October 2, 2008
060009524 / PL 0830999

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Ivy Nguyen, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at 604 North Camden Drive

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Eric Chen, R.A., of Creative Design Associates, Inc. on behalf of the property owners has filed an application for Track 2, Commission level design review to allow a new, two-story, 6,510 square foot single-family residence with attached two-car garage located at 604 North Camden Drive. The Commission previously reviewed the item at the August 7, 2008 meeting and requested that the applicant return for restudy as the Commission had several concerns regarding the project.

Commission Concerns and Applicant Response

Listed below are the Commission's concerns and the applicant's response.

Commission Concerns	Applicant Response
Choose an architectural style and incorporate more elements of that style into the design	Applicant appears to have provided more Spanish elements in the new design. However, staff feels that there may be some elements that do not exhibit an internal consistency within the design.
Windows under-scaled and should be recessed to provide more depth in keeping with Spanish style	Windows have been modified to be taller and have consistent window sizes and shapes. Windows feature mullions. Windows have been recessed 10" in the

	front and 4" in the side and rear.
Provide elevation of front door	Front entryway has been modified; a new precast concrete archway and new door has been proposed. A new front entryway tower proposed with small window for light to enter.
Reconsider elements above garage; possibly eliminating two roofs	Applicant revised plans to feature two balconies and eliminated the two roofs.
Consider shape of garage doors as they are not consistent with the windows	Shape of garage doors are now rectangular; garage entry surrounds added. One entry surround features an arch made of pre-cast concrete; the other surround is set back two feet and features two small windows measuring one foot by one foot.
Applicant to provide a more detailed material sample board	A material sample board will be provided at the Commission Meeting.
Provide details on corbels and projections	Applicant has eliminated corbels.

Additionally, the following changes have been made to the design of the house:

- Design of wrought iron railings have been modified at balconies, side gates; color remains black
- New chimney cap proposed in clay tile
- New French doors at second story with precast molding surrounds on front elevation proposed
- New vertical precast concrete moldings at front elevation
- New tower element at the second story of garage door entrance
- Two new lighting sconces proposed at front entry way
- Downspouts and gutters will be constructed of a dark brown sheet metal (not shown on current version of plans, but will be modified for final plans submission).

A copy of the August 7, 2008 staff report is attached for the Commission's reference.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the main house, walls, and fences meet all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

The circular driveway as proposed does not meet the Code requirements for paving and will be revised prior to final approval.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Eric Chen, R.A., of Creative Design Associates, Inc.
Project Owner	Steve and Jeanie Chen
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – North of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	12,530 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on July 21, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date, staff has not received any comments in regards to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed to be in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued (construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone).

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. *The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.*

Staff previously commented that the residence appears to feature Spanish elements with a contemporary interpretation. The revised proposal appears to feature more Spanish elements pursuant to the Commission's direction. However, the Commission may wish to discuss whether or not the garage door entrances are internally compatible with the design scheme.

2. *Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.*

Staff previously commented that the project utilizes the maximum amount of floor area allowed by the BHMC but exhibits a fair degree of modulation through the courtyard that is set back 17'-6" behind the required front yard in the front of the house. Further modulation is provided at the garage door entrances, and living room set back behind the required front yard setback.

The windows and doors have been modified from the original submission and appear to be of human size and scale. However, the Commission may wish to discuss whether the ornate wrought iron balconies and pre-cast concrete trim around the windows, front entry way door, and garage door minimizes the appearance of mass and scale of the residence as required pursuant to this criterion.

3. *The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.*

As previously discussed in criteria 1 and 2, the project appears to exhibit an internally compatible design scheme. The project utilizes thoughtful, high quality building materials including stucco walls with wood window trims and custom wrought iron work which will help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. *The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.*

The proposed project meets, and at some areas, exceeds the side setbacks required by the BHMC. As discussed in the previous staff report, the applicant will be providing landscaping along the six-foot tall fence along with an Australian Brush Cherry hedge at the east elevation to provide privacy to the abutting neighbor.

The neighbor at the western property line will have privacy protected by an existing hedge and landscaping along the block wall abutting the neighbor.

As a whole, the proposed project is not expected to create adverse impacts associated with privacy of neighbors.

- 5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

The properties along North Camden Drive are developed with structures varying in size and scale and there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern at present. There are number of older one-story homes with several new two-story developments in the vicinity. The proposed residence abuts an existing two-story residence and a one-story residence. Therefore, it appears that the proposed development's architectural style will fit in with the streetscape and is in harmony with the old and new residences in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for re-study and re-submittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for re-study, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. Applicant to comply with the paving requirements in the front yard set forth in Section 10-3-2422 of the Beverly Hills Municipal Code, or submit an application for a minor accommodation permit.

604 North Camden Drive
R-1 Design Review
For the Design Review Commission Meeting of October 2, 2008



IVY NGUYEN
Assistant Planner



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
August 7, 2008
060009524 / PL 0830999

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Ivy Nguyen, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at **604 North Camden Drive**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Eric Chen, R.A., of Creative Design Associates, Inc. on behalf of the property owners has filed an application for Track 2, Commission level design review to allow a new, two-story, 6,510 square foot single-family residence with attached two-car garage located at **604 North Camden Drive**. The applicant is also proposing a minor remodel of the exterior to the existing guesthouse in the rear of the property.

Reason for Review by the Commission

The proposed project does not strictly adhere to any pure architectural style as defined in the Style Catalogue, while there are features of the development that exhibit elements commonly found in Spanish residences.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the main house, walls, and fences meet all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Eric Chen, R.A., of Creative Design Associates, Inc.
Project Owner	Steve and Jeanie Chen
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – North of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	12,530 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is a rectangular-shaped lot that is approximately 80-feet wide by 157-feet long lot, located on the east side of the 600 block of North Camden Drive between Elevado Avenue and Carmelita Avenue. The current property contains a one-story residence with a one-story accessory building and pool at the rear. The existing residence will be demolished in order to allow for the construction of the proposed project. The abutting neighbor at the west is a two story single-family residence; the easterly neighbor is a one-story residence.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope

The proposed residence would have a total floor area of 6,510 square feet, which is nearly the maximum allowable building area (6,512 square feet) for the subject site. The floor area of the existing guesthouse is included in the cumulative floor area calculation.

As proposed, the residence will be 31'-9" to the highest point of the roof (32 feet maximum height allowed as each side setback is at least 10'), with an approximately 60-foot wide front façade.

Modulation

The main entrance of the house will be set in 17'-6" from the required front setback of 40'-0" creating a courtyard in front of the house that will add modulation along the front exterior of the property. A 6-foot tall by 20-foot wide black wrought iron fence will enclose the courtyard. In addition, two balconies approximately four feet deep located

on the second floor and windows inset by one foot will contribute to the modulation of the façade.

Parking

As required by the Beverly Hills Municipal Code (BHMC), three parking spaces are required for the five-bedroom project; the proposal will provide for four designated parking spaces, the maximum required by Code. Parking will be provided in an attached two-car garage at the front of the property with an additional two tandem parking spots at the side yard accessible from the circular driveway.

Design

The proposed design of the structure includes the following features:

- Two stories
- Functional outdoor "room" / courtyard
- Decorative ironwork on balconies
- Double door at balconies
- Arched windows
- Stucco wall surface in white

As proposed, the balance of the design appears to substantially adhere to the characteristics typically found in a Spanish Mission Revival architectural style as identified in the Style Catalogue.

Materials

The materials and color proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Stucco finish – Dunn Edwards "Birch White"
- Concrete roof tile – Eagle Roofing "Capistrano Hilo Sunset" (terracotta color)
- Wrought iron railings and fences – Black
- Wood with metal cladding – Marvin Windows & Doors "Bahama Brown"
- Wood corbels
- Precast concrete front entry surround
- Glass front door
- Wood garage door

A material sample board for the paint finish color, window trim, and glass glazing has been submitted for the Commission's review at the meeting.

Paving

The applicant had proposed the circular driveway method as paving in the front yard, with dimensions as required in Section 10-3-2422 of the BHMC. The driveway approaches are 12' wide, with a four feet wide walkway leading to the residence and a nine feet wide driveway to required parking at the west side lot line.

Landscape Design

The proposed project will provide for low-growing landscaping in front and behind the three-foot tall fence at the front property line. Ten-foot trunk Chinese Fountain Palms will be located in the front yard in front of the Great Room and along the driveway at the eastern elevation.

Additionally, Eugenia hedges will be planted along the wall at the rear along the eastern property line abutting the neighbors.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on July 21, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date, Staff has not received any comments in regards to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed to be in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued (construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone).

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. *The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.*

It appears the applicant has proposed a residence that features Spanish architectural elements with a contemporary interpretation. The Commission may wish to discuss whether the design is internally compatible.

2. *Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.*

The proposed design utilizes nearly the maximum amount of floor area permitted by the BHMC. The proposed height of the main residence is 31'-9" (maximum height allowed by Code is 32').

The proposed façade provides a degree of modulation and maximizes the use of open space with a courtyard set back 17'-6" behind the required front setback. Additionally, the living room is set back 2'-6" from the required front setback to allow for further modulation. The openings are of human scale and do not seem to negatively impact the overall scale and mass of the design.

As discussed in the project description section, the two balconies on the second floor add another degree of dimension and would have planters that will contribute to the garden quality of the city.

The proposed landscaping plan includes several ten-gallon palm trees (at the front of the residence and along the driveway to the garage) and a variety of low-growing plant materials in front and back of the three-foot fence at the front property and along the sides of the property; the overall landscaping plan will enhance the garden quality of the city.

3. *The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.*

The proposed project exhibits an internally compatible design scheme. The project utilizes thoughtful, high quality building materials including stucco walls with wood window trims and custom wrought iron work (at the balconies and front gate), which will help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

4. *The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.*

As discussed in item 2 above, the proposed project utilizes the maximum amount of floor area allowed by the BHMC. However, the proposed project meets, and at some areas, exceeds the side setbacks required by the BHMC. The applicant

will be providing landscaping along the six-foot tall fence at the east elevation to provide privacy to the abutting neighbor. There will be series of windows located on the second floor ranging from 3-4 feet wide by 4'-6" tall from the bathroom and bedroom. However, with the proposed landscaping, the neighbors' privacy will not be significantly negatively impacted. The Commission may wish to discuss the type and amount of landscaping that should be maintained to ensure the neighbors' privacy.

The neighbor at the side elevation at the west property line will be minimally impacted as tandem parking and a rubbish area are specified on the plans. Additionally, landscaping will be provided along a portion of the block wall abutting the neighbor.

Therefore, the proposed project is not expected to create adverse impacts associated with privacy of neighbors.

- 5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

The properties along North Camden Drive are developed with structures varying in size and scale and there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern at present; however, most homes can be classified as revival styles such as Colonial, Spanish, or Italian in design. Therefore, it appears that the proposed development is in harmony with the old and new residences in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for re-study and re-submittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for re-study, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. Applicant provide and maintain mature vegetation along the east property line to ensure the privacy of the neighbors.



IVY NGUYEN
Assistant Planner