



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
October 2, 2008.

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Shena Rojemann, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **216 N Oakhurst Drive.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Roberta Murray of Gabbay Architects, on behalf of the property owner, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow a new single-family residence at **216 N Oakhurst Drive.**

This item was initially reviewed by the Commission at its September 4, 2008 meeting. At that meeting, the Commission heard presentations from staff and the applicant as well as comments from a neighbor. The Commission recommended the design be re-studied and returned to the October 2, 2008 meeting addressing the following concerns:

- The overall design appears too “generic;”
- The windows are over-scaled;
- The columns above the doorway do not fit with the overall design;
- The French doors are over-scaled;
- The porte cochere is too tall and not in proportion with the rest of the house;
- The asymmetry is slight and should be emphasized or removed;
- The window above the planter at the first floor along the northern portion of the façade feels out of place.

REVISED DESIGN

The applicant addressed the Commission’s concerns above as follows:

1. The applicant has reduced the “generic” appearance of the façade by increasing the asymmetry, altering the rooflines and adding a roof above the entry, changing the style of the front door, and by adding elements such as a fountain and a decorative stained glass window.
2. The applicant has removed the window at the first floor along the northern portion of the façade. The applicant has reduced the size of the second floor window along the northern portion of the façade and has added stained glass. The window above the doorway has been reduced in height, but widened to be more consistent with the rectangular French doors along the southern portion of the façade.
3. The applicant has removed the columns at the second story above the doorway.
4. The applicant has reduced the height of the French door at the first story along the southern portion of the façade from 9 feet to 8 feet. The French doors at the second story have remained at 8 feet.
5. The applicant has reduced the height of the porte cochere from 12 feet 6 inches to 10 feet 6 inches.
6. The applicant has increased the asymmetry of the residence by:
 - Raising the roofline along the northern portion of the façade;
 - Adding a fountain and stained glass window along the northern portion of the façade;
 - Adding further modulation to the northern portion of the façade by stepping the corners of the façade back 3 feet from the flat front portion of the façade;
 - Adding corbels below the bellyband along the southern portion of the façade.
7. The window above the planter at the first floor along the northern portion of the façade has been removed and replaced with a fountain feature.

The overall materials and colors have not been revised. A materials board will be presented at the meeting.

Code Compliance

As proposed, the design meets all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on August 25, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date staff has not received any comments in regard to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

As revised, the design addresses the Commission's concerns outlined above intended to result in a more internally compatible design. Key design elements such as the windows are now more proportionate with the rest of the design and the design has been revised to emphasize asymmetrical elements such as a tower that contributes to the design appearing more Spanish in style.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

As revised, the design appears to better utilize modulation and asymmetry along the front façade to reduce the scale and mass of the structure. The northern portion of the proposed façade has increased in height and has been further modulated by stepping a portion of the façade three feet back from the existing flat façade. Additionally, the tall vertical windows have been removed and reduced along this portion of the façade. The reduction of the height of the French doors at the first floor along the southern portion of the façade further reduces the vertical appearance. Therefore, the scale and mass of the revised design is not anticipated to have an adverse impact on the surrounding neighborhood.

3. The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.

As stated in items 1) and 2) above, the revised residence shall provide a number of elements consistent with the Mediterranean/Spanish style architecture while providing

improved scale and mass to the site. The proposed project utilizes high quality building materials, which shall help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood. Additionally, the landscaping will help to enhance the proposed residence.

4. The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.

As revised, the proposed structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. The southern elevation contains small windows along the second story which shall have a minimal impact on the neighbors privacy. Along the northern elevation, the windows are mostly smaller in size as well, however the Commission may wish to discuss the large window (aligned with the staircase) toward the front of the house.

5. The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.

The design patterns in the area are characterized by consistent setbacks and straight driveways located at the side property lines leading to a garage and/or a porte cochere and a walkway leading from the public sidewalk to the entryway of the residence. The proposed design is consistent with this pattern. The existing neighborhood is composed of one and two-story single-family residences. The proposed home will be built to current codes and, as a result, will appear larger than the homes immediately adjacent. It is typical for new homes to be built with two stories and to the maximum floor area allowed by Code and the Commission will need to determine if the design modulation is such that the proposed design can be found to ensure harmony between old and new homes in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or
4. Return the plans for restudy and resubmittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide direction and require re-study or approve the project with any conditions the Commission may wish to add.



SHENA ROJEMANN
Assistant Planner

Attachments:
Staff Report of September 4, 2008



STAFF REPORT
CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
September 4, 2008.
PL0838659

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Shena Rojemann, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, south of Santa Monica Boulevard at **216 N Oakhurst Drive**.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Roberta Murray of Gabbay Architects, on behalf of the property owner, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow a new single-family residence at **216 N Oakhurst Drive**.

Reason for Review by the Commission

The architectural style of the proposed project has been called out by the applicant as Mediterranean, but staff determined it does not substantially adhere to a pure architectural style as outlined in the Style Catalogue. Consequently, the proposal is being brought before the Design Review Commission for review as a Track 2 application.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the design meets all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION

Applicant	Roberta Murray
Project Owner	Mr. and Mrs. Khoubian
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – South of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	7,450 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is approximately 50-feet wide by 150-feet long, located on the east side of the 100 block of N Oakhurst Drive between Dayton Way and Clifton Way. The lot is currently developed with a single-story residence and detached garage/guest house. The existing primary residence and garage/guest house would be demolished and replaced by a new two-story residence with a basement and porte cochere. Surrounding development consists of one- and two-story single-family homes.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope/Modulation

The proposed house would have a total floor area of 4,430 square feet, just under the maximum allowable building area (4,500 square feet) for the subject site.

As proposed, the total height of the residence would be approximately 30 feet to the highest point of the roof (30 feet maximum height allowed for a sloped roof). The applicant has used front setback averaging pursuant to the Code. Approximately 10' of the proposed façade is set back 26'-6" from the front property line (1'-6" behind the required 25' front yard setback). Approximately 16' of the proposed façade is set back 22'-6" from the front property line (encroaching into the front yard setback 2'-6"). The remaining 7'-6" of the façade is set back between 31'-2" from the front property line (6'-2" behind the required 25' front yard setback). The main entrance to the proposed structure (recessed 4'-9" from the adjacent façade) consists of an arched entryway with double doors constructed of wrought iron and glass. A portion of the second floor on the southern half of the facade has been stepped back providing a balcony area at the second floor. The variations in façade depth create greater modulation.

The structure also includes a 2,207 square foot basement for which the light and air requirements are met by providing large lightwells along the southern portion of the residence.

Parking

As required by §10-3-2419 of the BHMC, a total of three parking spaces behind the front yard setback have been proposed in conjunction with the new house. The proposed parking will be provided by a porte cochere and a concrete pad on the north side of the residence and two spaces are located on concrete pads accessed from the alley at the rear of the property. No garage is proposed on the subject site.

Design

The proposed design of the structure is called out as "Mediterranean" by the project's designer and includes the following features:

- Two stories;
- Visible heavy eaves;
- Stucco walls;
- Arched windows and entries, generally recessed;
- Masonry walls;
- Porte cochere.

Materials

The materials and color proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Stucco - La Habra "French Vanilla X-55"
- Precast Concrete moldings – La Habra "Aspen X-23"
- Roof - Clay tiles by McBean Gladding - "Kiln Run #8 Mix" Italian Pan
- Wooden doors and windows – Old Master Products "Red Wine";
- Wrought iron railings and front door;
- Copper spouts.

A material board will be presented at the meeting.

Paving

Per the BHMC §10-3-2422, the total amount of paving permitted within the front yard of the subject site is 400 square feet. The proposed project includes a total of 371 square feet of paving within the front yard, under the maximum amount permitted by the BHMC.

Landscape Design:

The proposed project includes existing and new landscaping within the front yard consisting of drought tolerant and non-drought tolerant plants including large existing trees in the front yard. A detailed landscape plan has been provided.

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on August 25, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date staff has not received any comments in regard to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued.

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3.4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.

The proposed design has design elements that are consistent with the Mediterranean style as evidenced by the clay tile roof, visible heavy eaves, arched windows and entries and porte cochere. The Commission may wish to discuss the unusual placement of the smaller window on the ground floor (it is illuminating the stairway) and the size of the French doors at the ground floor.

2. Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.

The proposed design utilizes modulation along the front façade to reduce the scale and mass of the structure. A portion of the second floor has been stepped back and the

recessed arched entryway incorporates further modulation. Therefore, the scale and mass of the proposed project is not expected to have an adverse impact on the surrounding neighborhood.

3. *The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.*

As stated in items 1) and 2) above, the residence shall provide a number of elements consistent with the Mediterranean style architecture while providing appropriate scale and mass to the site. The proposed project utilizes high quality building materials, which shall help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood. Additionally, the landscaping will help to enhance the proposed residence.

4. *The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.*

As proposed, the structure meets the City's current side setback requirements. The southern elevation contains small windows along the second story which shall have a minimal impact on the neighbors privacy. Along the northern elevation, the windows are mostly smaller in size as well, however the Commission may wish to discuss the large window (aligned with the staircase) towards the front of the house.

5. *The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.*

As proposed, the project is consistent with the prevailing design patterns of the surrounding neighborhood. The design patterns are characterized by straight driveways located at the side property lines leading to a garage and/or a porte cochere and a walkway leading from the public sidewalk to the entryway of the residence. Thus, having design patterns consistent with those of the neighboring properties will ensure harmony between old and new homes in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;
2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;
3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or

4. Return the plans for restudy and resubmittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with any conditions the Commission may wish to add.

SHENA ROJEMANN
Assistant Planner