

Attachment 1

Summary of Public Meetings

Dog Park Timeline

(All dates are for Recreation and Parks Commission Meetings unless otherwise noted)

February 23, 2010

TAB 3. Council Member Inquiry Regarding Dog Park

Staff was asked by City Councilmember John Mirisch to bring forth the topic of a dog park for discussion at a future City Council Study Session as noted in commission staff report.

Commission was asked to share their interests or thoughts on this topic and possibly address alternative locations(s) if Roxbury is not deemed suitable or appropriate.

Commissioner Rothner provided information on dog parks in other areas and encouraged others to research logging onto the internet websites provided. Commission was in agreement to survey residents at the upcoming Woofstock event to determine if there is any interest.

Staff noted Councilmember Mirisch would be kept apprised.

March 23, 2010 to December 21, 2010 not a topic of discussion.

January 25, 2011

COMMENTS BY COMMISSIONERS INCLUDING TOPICS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS

Chairperson Block requested the Dog Park topic be included in future agenda and asked Commissioners for feedback. Vice Chairperson Rothner noted this idea was one Commission and staff has researched including visiting possible locations. Though some sites were considered, they were not feasible. If an area is considered the area should meet the high standards of Beverly Hills. She noted many other cities are not allowing dogs in their public parts due to liability issues. Suggestions of locations included the Roxbury Lawn Bowling Greens, area adjacent to the Bridle Path, Orange Grove, or on Doheny and Santa Monica Blvd.

There was consensus for staff to revisit possible areas and bring back item for Commission discussion.

February 22, 2011 to March 22, 2011 not a topic of discussion.

April 26, 2011

Tab 5. Off-Leash Dog Area Concept

Staff provided a detailed report in the Commission packet per Commissioner's request for information. There are 400 dogs licensed in Beverly Hills. It is proposed to use Field #3 at La Cienega Park; the largest of the three fields there. Commission discussion included not supporting the idea of a field used for both a dog park and sports activity, looking at alternative sites such as Roxbury Park (Lawn Bowling Area) and the "Industrial Area," and outreach to dog owners.

MOVED by Gersh, SECONDED by Rothner to continue discussion and form an Ad Hoc Committee. (4/0)

AYES: Anderson, Gersh, Rothner, Block
ABSENT: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

May 24, 2011 no discussion.

June 28, 2011

Tab 2. Off-Leash Dog Park

Community Services Director Steve Zoet briefs Commission on the previous direction to analyze and evaluate potential opportunities to host a dog park within the community. Some cities use athletic fields as a dual purpose and there was previous discussion about using La Cienega park. It was not the interest of the Commission to move forward with that location so Staff has looked at other options. Unfortunately we don't have much opportunity to take an undeveloped area and convert it for this use, as other communities may, so we are looking at existing amenities that may serve the same purpose. Recreation Services Manager Teri Angel presented three areas for consideration/further review:

- 1) The 300 Block of Foothill Road & Alden Drive:
Public Works Department is located there as well as a local veterinarian. It would be located on the backside/alley way (31,000 square foot strip of land). Photos were in the Commissioners packet for reference. It would take a lot of work to clear this area out. It is currently used for Public Works refuse and our tree trimming company leases space. Using this space would curtail their activities and would need a lot of clean up. Local

businesses nearby already complain about the trash and trucks. This location would need additional Staff analysis.

2) The Putting Green Area at Roxbury Park:

This area is located on Olympic Blvd., on the far west side. A fence would need to be installed in this area which is used very infrequently. It is seen as being an easy set-up and not going to affect that many people. A potential issue would be it is close to a picnic area and walking track as well as the residents near the alley.

3) The Croquet Green at Roxbury Park.

This area is mid-block on Olympic Blvd. It has easy access, is “ready-made,” and would need a fence installed. Not sure if it would be a factor for the neighbors living on Olympic Blvd. Staff proposes this is an ideal location.

Staff suggests additional research to local dog owners and the community at large for their opinions. The original master plan does not have an off-leash dog area included, so there may be community members who are opposed. In time perhaps, a dog organization can assist with maintenance costs and lend support when necessary. It also needs to be considered what types of dog will be allowed; if both small and large dogs will share the same area.

Commissioner Rosoff asked if there has been market research done to find out who would use the park. An informally survey was done at Woofstock, held in March and respondents were in favor of an off-leash dog park at Roxbury Park. They like the already established park environment. Also many people are using the high school front lawn and this would hopefully draw them away from that area.

Commissioner Friedman asked if there is a report on the usage of the two areas at Roxbury Park. Staff responded that the croquet club has 15 registered members, of which 2 are residents. This group paid dues totaling \$1,300 for the year (\$17 each per year). It is costly to maintain the grass on the bowling & croquet greens. Staff also relayed although this may be a temporary area, it would not be affected by any proposed construction at Roxbury Park. Other communities have organizations to support off leash dog areas and they are a great resource for helping with rules and regulations as well as giving advice as to whether both large and small dogs can be accommodated.

Other comments included the maintenance challenges facing our limited Staff. Dog owners would be expected to “pick up” after themselves and in many communities with established off-leash dog parks, usership must prove, within a reasonable amount of time, their abilities to

maintain the facility themselves or with assistance of a club or organized group as to not become a burden of Staff. It is recommended that this project be on a trial basis. Staff also relayed the Foothill location was a request by Councilmember Mirisch as an existing City controlled resource.

Commissioner Anderson asked about parking constraints. Staff agreed that there may be an increased amount of parking depending on the usage. Commissioner Anderson favored the putting green location. The Foothill area has been looked at for a development site in the past; it is a prime piece of real estate owned by the City of Beverly Hills.

Vice Chair Gersh suggested forming a group who will be involved in organizing the dog park. She voiced her preference for the croquet green location as a trial because of the Olympic Blvd access and the few residents nearby coupled with the limited usage at this time. The trial period would garner more public opinion and see if the community kept it clean and supported it. The Bowling Green seems to have more possible resident opposition. She felt the Foothill location would have significant costs to get it "into shape" and that there would be many complaints from the tenants in the area.

Staff explained that in the past years of the Woofstock event, names and interest have been solicited to see if there is interest in this project. It is important to have a group of people who will be committed to the development of the rules and an understanding of what that will entail.

Staff suggested the next step is for the Commission to identify the location or locations they are interested in for the proposed dog park and allow staff to report on fine tuning of cost estimates and report back to Commission at next meeting. Staff can also seek potential sponsorship using contacts from the Woofstock event especially if additional amenities are desired by the usership.

Chairperson Block strongly prefers the choice of the industrial area where there are no adjacent residences. It is a degraded area and is by far the better location. He thinks it may also be better for a long term or permanent solution. He thinks there is a lot going on at Roxbury and having a dog park would mean the loss of green space. He also projects concern from the neighbors at both proposed Roxbury Park locations as well as the parking issues. In a recent discussion with the City of Malibu, he found that they have a dog park that allows both large and small dogs in the same space and they have not had any problems. Lastly he suggested a positive revenue generating idea of licensing all the dogs that come to use the park. Recreation Supervisor Teri

Angel relayed that 424 dogs are registered in the City of Beverly Hills but the licensing is done through the City of Los Angeles.

Commissioner Rosoff thinks the only positive to the industrial area is its size. The cost of creating it with the budgetary concerns would be prohibitive and there is no Ranger on site. He said the Croquet Green area to be the most desirable.

Commissioner Friedman likes the park setting and is a friendlier spot to be. She also believes the size of Foothill is good but is not sure people will drive there. She likes the overall atmosphere of the Roxbury Park locations and for a trial it would be a good fit with a small investment.

There was also a brief discussion about a possible Coldwater Canyon location but the storm drain location and the concern of the dog waste going down it and into the ocean has made it undesirable.

Commissioner Block suggests public outreach/hearing on the topic and would like to pursue giving the community a chance to voice their opinion.

MOVED by Gersh, SECONDED by Friedman to direct Staff to look at all three locations that have been submitted by Staff for a proposed dog park to determine costs and suitability of location.
(5/0)

AYES: Friedman, Rosoff, Anderson, Gersh, Block

ABSENT: NONE

ABSTAIN: NONE

CARRIED

July 26, 2011

Tab 2. Off-Leash Dog Park Follow Up

The Commission had previously discussed three proposed sites for an off-leash dog area:

- 1) The 300 Block of Foothill Road & Alden Drive;
- 2) The Putting Green Area at Roxbury Park;
- 3) The Croquet Green at Roxbury Park.

Since the last Commission meeting the Foothill Road area is no longer a viable option. Recreation Services Manager Teri Angel has done outreach to various community members for input regarding the project. The costs for each area have been provided to the Commissioners as well as any additional costs that may be incurred. It has been suggested to have both a small

and large dog area. Some community outreach has been done with initial ideas reported to the Commission. The Commissioners discussed the two remaining areas and concluded the Croquet Green would be the best option at this time due to the existing hedging and current available parking. The Croquet Green does have a croquet club with 15 members, two of which are Beverly Hills residents, paying an annual fee of \$1,200 and the Putting Green is an open area for public use. Using the Croquet Green as an off-leash dog park would result in shared use of the lawn bowling green.

As the off-leash dog park is not part of the current Master Plan, a test period in a “temporary” location would be advisable. There are still other issues to be determined such as hours and possible fees.

MOVED by Rosoff, SECONDED by Gersh to direct Staff to investigate further into the use of the Croquet Green (located at the northeast side of the park) determine usability and expenses related to it as an off-leash dog area. (4/0/1)

AYES: Rosoff, Anderson, Gersh, Block

NOES: NONE

ABSENT: Friedman

ABSTAIN: NONE

CARRIED

September 19, 2011 to July 24, 2012 no discussion on the topic.

September 25, 2012

Tab 5. Reconsideration of Dog Park Locations

Community Services Director Steve Zoet reviewed the history of possible locations for an off-leash dog park and requested Commission input. Vice Mayor Mirisch has requested an update at an upcoming City Council Meeting.

MOVED by Rosoff , SECONDED by Friedman that the Recreation and Parks Commission recommend to the City Council that they consider a modification to the Master Plan to concern itself with the establishment of an off-leash dog park at Roxbury Park, principally at the current croquet field. (5/0)

AYES: Block, Friedman, Rosoff, Anderson, Gersh

NOES: NONE

ABSENT: NONE

ABSTAIN: NONE

CARRIED

October 23, 2012

Tab 6. Director's Report

The proposed off leash dog park will be presented to the City Council for further consideration and direction.

October 23, 2012 CITY COUNCIL STUDY SESSION MEETING

Item on Agenda – not discussed

Request by Vice-Mayor Mirisch for an Update on Possible Locations for an Off-Leash Dog Park

November 13, 2012 CITY COUNCIL STUDY SESSION MEETING

Item on Agenda – not discussed

Request by Vice-Mayor Mirisch for an Update on Possible Locations for an Off-Leash Dog Park

November 20, 2012 CITY COUNCIL STUDY SESSION MEETING

Item on Agenda - discussed

Request by Vice-Mayor Mirisch for an Update on Possible Locations for an Off-Leash Dog Park – Staff Summary

RPC has discussed matter a number of times and now seeks direction from City Council. On September 15, 2012 discussed 5 different options for location. RPC recommended repurposing the croquet field at Roxbury Park for a six month trial period.

Mirisch – supportive of recommendation. Well worth exploring and many in community would use it. Question about liability posed to City Attorney. Rules will be posted. Solicit ideas from other established dog parks. Would prefer a release form but that may not be practical.

Gold -asked if residents were at RPC Meetings. Zoet - There was not a unified group coming.

Question was about Southwest Homeowners group coming. Gold suggested to reach out and perform vigorous outreach to the community to ensure that they are comfortable with area and potential impacts. Also wanted to investigate the proximity of the pre-school and its

proximity to the location. Would be locked at night? Zoet – would be open during park hours – close at 10. Likes Croquet Field option the best. Suggested looking at parcel #13 to see if they wanted to lease the land for a dog park.

Bosse – Outreach to the residents in the area? Zoet – mailer notification with a defined perimeter. Can door knock if necessary. Also poll users of the park, make sure it does not conflict with other uses of the park. Will contact Southwest Homeowners Association. Zoet - Assuming we get support from the residents, it would be a quick turnaround to open. Would like to re visit after six months see what is working/reevaluate.

Brucker – No one has discussed the parking impacts and the difficulties they will pose. He surmises that there will be hundreds of extra cars coming to use the park and cause a disturbance to the area. Agrees that is it a good size. Thinks that Coldwater/Orange Grove or La Cienega would be better opportunities. Also concerned with preschool and the dog interactions.

Bosse – Brucker is suggesting a very large dog park. Roxbury would be a small neighborhood dog park. – 14,000 sq feet. Does not think that parking/traffic concerns will happen and if it does happen the situation can be revisited after the six month trial.

Direction from City Council is to meet with community and do the outreach. Parking may be an important impact. Need to reach out now southwest to inform them of project. Need feedback from the groups and make sure they are engaged. Make sure to invite all in the area not just the members of the board of the Southwest Homeowners Associations.

November 27, 2012

No discussion on the topic.

December 18, 2012

Tab 5. Director's Report

The public meeting regarding a possible Roxbury Dog Park will be held on January 28 at 6:30 p.m. at Roxbury Park Auditorium. Outreach to potential meeting attendees will be via Park Rangers staff, mailing, newspaper advertising, City web-site posting and other means via our Department Publicist.

January 22, 2013

Tab 6. Director's Report

Off-leash dog area community meeting taking place January 28 at Roxbury Park Auditorium. Commissioners are invited to attend.

January 28, 2013

Public Meeting held at Roxbury Park

February 5, 2013 CITY COUNCIL STUDY SESSION MEETING

Item on Agenda - discussed

Update Regarding the Public Meeting About the Proposed Roxbury Park Off-Leash Dog Area. Staff will update City Council about the public meeting held on January 28 at Roxbury park to discuss a proposed off leash dog area within the park.

Assistant Director of Community Services Nancy Hunt-Coffey recapped the public meeting regarding the proposed off-leash dog park at Roxbury Park. Recreation and Parks Commission Chair Robert Anderson and Commissioner Simone Friedman were in attendance to answer questions.

The following members of the public spoke on the item:

- Bill Wolff, Beverly Hills Lawn Bowling Club
- Ken Goldman, Southeast Homeowners Association
- Rochelle Ginsburg
- Robbie Anderson, Recreation and Parks Commission Chair
- Judy Okun
- Steve Dahlerbruch, President of the Beverly/Roxbury Homeowners Association

Director of Community Services Steve Zoet provided information on the number of times this item was agendized on the Recreation and Parks Commission.

City Manager Kolin provided information on the public noticing that was conducted for this subject.

Council did not reach consensus on this item. Mayor Brien created an Ad Hoc Committee consisting of Vice Mayor Mirisch and Councilmember Bosse to work further on finding a location for an off-leash dog park.

February 26, 2013

Tab 3. Update Regarding Dog Park

Community Services Director Steve Zoet updated the Commission regarding the off-leash dog discussion by City Council. Vice Mayor Mirisch and Councilmember Bosse have been appointed by the Mayor to discuss future ideas and options with staff, community members and commission liaisons.

An Ad Hoc Committee with Commissioners Gersh and Friedman will be initiated.

March 26, 2013 - (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairperson reports – Gersh/Friedman) to August 13, 2013 (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairpersons reports – Friedman/Bilak) no discussion on the topic.

September 26, 2013 (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairpersons reports – Friedman/Bilak)

Commissioners Friedman and Bilak visited Orange Grove area to possible off leash dog area. Staff suggested Ad Hoc members meeting with Staff prior to October Commission Meeting to discuss next steps. Commissioners inquired as to why Roxbury was no longer a feasible option. Staff responded that item will be agendaized for a future meeting to be further discussed.

October 22, 2013

Tab 4. Discussion Regarding Dog Park.

Commissioners Bilak and Friedman commented on the recent Ad Hoc Meeting held where different areas in the City were discussed as possible off-leash dog areas. Community organized support would be necessary for the project to succeed. After review of all areas formerly under consideration, it was concluded, if necessary, to further assess both opportunities within the City that may and may not have been fully explored. No specific action is being taken at this time.

November 26, 2013 (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairpersons reports – Friedman/Bilak)

Commissioner Bilak discussed an off-leash dog area with the Teen Advisory Committee members at their meeting.

December 16, 2013 (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairpersons reports – Friedman/Bilak)

No discussion on the topic.

January 28, 2014 (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairpersons reports – Friedman/Bilak)

Commissioner Friedman suggested the area on the corner of Rexford Drive and Sunset Boulevard for potential Recreation and Parks usage including an off-leash dog park. Staff relayed that it is a reservoir site and there are concerns with what uses it can have. In addition parking may be a limiting factor. Staff encouraged Commissioners to get familiar with the site if there is to be future discussion.

February 25, 2014

Tab 6. Request by Commissioner Bilak to Discuss Off-Leash Dog Area

Community Services Director Steve Zoet reported that the site at the corner of Sunset Boulevard and Rexford Drive is being used as a quasi off-leash dog area. Due to a possible crack in the lid of the reservoir, the City's Public Works Staff are not supporting this area for this permanent use. Other locations that have been previously discussed were re-addressed. Commissioners discussed the possibility of converting the Croquet area at Roxbury Park to be explored again. Commissioners suggested outreach to the Community to gauge interest in the concept.

March 25, 2014

Tab 11. Director's Report

Mayor Bosse has expressed interest in revisiting the topic of the off-leash dog area. In the "industrial area." Vice Chair Friedman and Commissioner Bilak will continue on the Ad Hoc Committee and will report back with any new developments.

April 3, 2014

City Council/Recreation and Parks Commission Liaison Meeting – *topic- Location considerations for the Operation of a Proposed Dog Park*

April 22, 2014 (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairperson reports – Friedman/Bilak)

Tab 7. Director's Report

Commissioners Freedman & Bilak serving on Committee for off-leash dog area. A meeting occurred a few weeks ago with another one upcoming. Area to be focused on (pending direction of City Council) is adjacent to Public Works Building on Foothill/Alden/3rd Street. May be able to incorporate part of the site for dog park use. Will be presented the evening of May 6. Should be able to report back to Commission at May Meeting.

April 28, 2014

City Council/Recreation and Parks Commission Liaison Meeting – *topic - Location considerations for the Operation of a Proposed Dog Park*

Met at site, then meeting in Public Works Facility

May 6, 2014 CITY COUNCIL FORMAL MEETING

Item on Agenda – discussed

Request by Mayor Bosse to Consider a Proposed Location for the Construction and Operation of an Off-Leash Dog Park

This item provides an overview of a proposed site on the southeast corner of Foothill Road and Alden Drive for an off-leash dog area discussed at Recreation and Parks Liaison Committee Meetings on April 3, 2014 and April 28, 2014.

Community Services Director Steve Zoet provided a PowerPoint and oral report. He provided a historical background, a map of the proposed location, and a conceptual site plan with shared space. He also discussed the favorable attributes of the site and cost estimate. He also noted that support was received from Mercedes Benz of Beverly Hills General Manager Bruce Schulman as well as other neighboring residents who were contacted by email.

Speakers:

Tina Sinatra – Supporter of the dog park.

Alan Block – Former Recreation and Parks Commission, current Planning Commissioner. – Supporter of the dog park.

Teri Austin, Amanda Foundation President – Supporter of the dog park.

Rabbi Pini Dunner, Young Israel Temple and affiliated communities – Rabbi representing his and three other temples in the area are opposed to the dog park location.

Bill Crowe, Pets 90210 – Supporter of the dog park. Read letter from Paula Kent Meehan also in support.

Marc Saleh – Supporter of the dog park.

Tracy Jones – Supporter of the dog park. Read letters from Carrie Brillstein & Luciano Solomon.

Harriet Stuart – Supporter of the dog park. Was at meeting January 28, 2013 at Roxbury Park.

Rob Gaudio, Owner Pussy & Pooch – Supporter of the dog park.

Kimberly Reiss – Supporter of the dog park.

Tanaz Akhlaghi – Supporter of the park.

Mayor Bosse acknowledged receiving correspondence from Arnie & Pat Sklar, Ronnie Kassorla,

Howard S. Fisher and Harriet Stuart – all in favor of the dog park.

Frances Bilak, Recreation and Parks Commissioner

Council liaison Councilmember Mirisch commented on the benefits of the location such as it being a City-owned property and thus easier to expand if the pilot project works, and being able to add green, open space in the middle of the City. As Council co-liaison, Mayor Bosse commented that a dog park will enhance the quality of life in the City, and the location is ideal in the sense of ample parking and the presence of a dog hospital in the area.

Councilmember Krasne asked staff whether a rubber membrane will be installed underneath the decomposed granite and whether it is included in the proposed budget, whether there will be rules and regulations governing the use of the park, and whether a unisex bathroom would be included.

Councilmember Brien suggested considering the La Cienega Park as a potential dog park with easier community access in a larger park setting. He expressed concerns regarding issues with the synagogues, which he feels should be taken care of before making the final decision, as well as concerns regarding noticing and public outreach of the multi-family home residents along maple Drive because they have not yet come forward with their support and they do not have a homeowners association making it more difficult to have one point of contact. He suggested reaching out to all the Board members of all the temples, not just their representatives.

Vice Mayor Gold also voiced his concern regarding the synagogues' issues and suggested having a dialogue with them before proceeding with the project. He proposed to use an area for the project that is further away from the synagogues which may help mitigate the concerns they have. He also suggested that Council discuss the Ranger/staff needed for the project.

MOVED by Councilmember Mirisch, seconded by Councilmember Krasne to approve on a pilot basis and with continued dialogue and public outreach to the synagogues and neighbors, Item G-1 as follows:

ITEM G-1: APPROVED ON A PILOT BASIS AND WITH CONTINUED DIALOGUE AND PUBLIC OUTREACH TO THE SYNAGOGUES AND NEIGHBORS

Ayes: Councilmember Krasne, Councilmember Mirisch, and Mayor Bosse

Noes: Councilmember Brien, and Vice Mayor Gold

CARRIED

May 27, 2014

Tab 8. Director's Report

Steve Zoet and staff updated the commission on off-leash dog area. Follow-up meeting is scheduled for June 12 for the City Council approved dog park location at Foothill Road and Third Street. Meeting will address concerns voiced by rabbi at Young Israel Synagogue that is adjacent to the location. Invitations will be extended to the leadership of the adjacent synagogues. Additional meetings to follow as necessary. Will keep Commission apprised.

June 12, 2014

City Council/Recreation and Parks Commission Liaison Meeting – *topic – Proposed Dog Park Location*

June 24, 2014 (On agenda under Ad Hoc Chairperson reports – Friedman/Bilak)

Tab 6. Ad Hoc Chairperson Reports

Commissioners attended meeting and walk through of proposed area. Vice Chair Friedman reported that the approved spot is the best possible location. Rabbis and congregants were in attendance at meeting. Tried to be accommodating and respectful with their concerns. Hard to address people being fearful of dogs. Addressed noise, cleaning up after animals, and closure for Shabbat with group. One congregant was very vocal and had a lot of concerns. The rabbis were most concerned about closures for Shabbat and specific holidays. After two hours at the meeting, felt more comfortable than when they started. Trying to please everyone as best as possible and be as flexible as possible. Did not discuss specifics of times/hours. Chair Rosoff questioned possible closure options.

Next step will be an Environmental Review to be done by a consultant from the Community Development Department.

August 26, 2014

Commissioners asked for an updates of the ground analysis for proposed off-leash dog park.

September 22, 2014

Tab 6. Director's Report

Environmental assessment of site is nearing completion. The report on potential soil contaminants will be release in a few weeks.

October 28, 2014

Tab 7. Capital Improvement Projects Update

The preliminary draft from Community Development staff was not released by the October Commission Meeting time. The findings will likely be available for the November Commission Meeting.

November 24, 2014

Tab 8. Capital Improvement Projects Update

Capital Improvement Projects Update – Draft report has not been completely reviewed in respect to the site and any remediation costs. The proposed site has had multiple uses over the years and its suitability is yet to be assessed.

December 16, 2014

Tab 2. La Cienega Park and Community Center Public Meeting

Community Services Director Steve Zoet reported on the recent public meeting to gather ideas and comments for possible improvements to the grounds, Community Center and other assets associated with the park. Commissioner Bilak extended her thoughts on the meeting. Resident Mark Elliott spoke about the prospect of a dog park in the area as well as incorporating bicycle uses in and around the park. The public will be advised of future meeting dates as they are scheduled.

Tab 5. Capital Improvement Projects Update

There is evidence of soil contaminants in the area of the proposed off leash dog area. Discussions are underway for further information to be provided and additional direction obtained from City Council.

January 15, 2015

City Council/Recreation and Parks Commission Liaison Meeting – *Report on the Proposed Dog Park*

January 27, 2015

No Discussion on the topic.

February 24, 2015

Tab 6. Capital Improvement Projects Update

There is no further update on the Off-Leash Dog Park. Communication with other involved City Departments is continuing.

March 31, 2015

Tab 8. Capital Improvement Projects Update

Dog Park - No further updates form Community Development and the City Attorney in regard to the soil analysis.

April 28, 2015

ORAL COMMUNICATION FROM THE AUDIENCE

Speaker:

Mark Elliot spoke about re-interest in an off-leash dog park at Roxbury Park.

Concern will be agendized at a future Recreation and Parks Commission Meeting.

Tab 6. Capital Improvement Projects Update

Dog Park – Staff is waiting for direction from the Community Development Department.

May 5, 2015

City Council/Recreation and Parks Commission Liaison Meeting – topic – Off-Leash Dog park Update

Assistant Director of Community Development/City Planner Ryan Gohlich reported that the environmental review had been done last year. There is evidence of arsenic contamination in the soil. They are looking into mitigation of the area. It is proposed to remove top portion of soil and replace. Cost estimate is \$200,000. Comments – Need documentation to certify that mitigation is sufficient. Waiting for DTSC ruling on parcels #12 & #13, they will have a public meeting on this matter. They will explain what can be developed in that area.

June 1, 2015

Tab 5. Dog Park Discussion

Speakers

Mark Elliott – in favor of Dog Park at Roxbury. He brought this item forward for the Commission to re-visit. The Roxbury Park location would be accessible to many residents. He was not involved with the Foothill/Alden location approved by City Council.

Susan Eisenberg – in favor of Dog Park at Roxbury for her dog’s exercise needs, She noted there are areas of Roxbury Park that are under-utilized that could be developed for a Dog Park.

Reggie Sully reading statement from Marcia Hobbs – in favor of two Dog Parks in Beverly Hills.

Ken Goldman – representing Southwest Homeowners Association. He commented there are already many activities at the park and it is surrounded by residents. The Board is opposed to a Dog Park at Roxbury.

Rose Norton – commented that the location recommended by City Council is more appropriate. She is opposed to Dog Park at Roxbury due to proximity of pre-school and busy Olympic Blvd.

Kathi Rothner – commented on many aspects of the overall issue noting her support for a Dog Park in Beverly Hills.

Dr. Sharon Ignarro – in favor of Dog Park she can walk to Roxbury for her dogs exercise needs.

Dr. Lou Ignarro – wants an accessible area nearby his home and is in favor of the Dog Park being at Roxbury.

Cindy Norian – is concerned with the safety of the dogs and is opposed to Dog Park at Roxbury.

After discussion, the Commission provided feedback with regard to Mark Elliott’s interest in an off-leash dog area at Roxbury Park. There was no official vote taken but Commissioner comments indicated there was not majority support for bringing back the Roxbury Park Dog Park proposal. The Commission is in support of the Foothill/Alden location the City Council has previously approved and is awaiting further information on that location.

August 4, 2015 CITY COUNCIL STUDY SESSION MEETING

Item on Agenda - discussed

Review of Proposed Dog Park Design Concepts and the Associated Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration

It is recommended that City Council review the proposed design concepts and the site’s associated Draft Mitigated Negative Declaration and provide direction to staff regarding the desired design and operations for the Foothill/Alden Dog Park.

Director of Community Services Steve Zoet reported on the proposed dog park design concepts for City Council consideration and stated the associated draft Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) attached to this report is available for public comment until August 20th.

Mr. Zoet acknowledged the presence of Community Development Department Assistant Director/City Planner Ryan Gohlich to answer any questions regarding the MND.

Speakers:

1. Christina Whalen
2. Bill Crowe, Executive Director of Pets 90210
3. Tracy Jones on behalf of Tina Sinatra
4. Ten Austin, President of The Amanda Foundation
5. Arthur Cohen
6. Tern Gerber
7. Marcia Hobbs
8. Ilona Sherman
9. Alma Ordaz

Recreation and Parks Commission (RPC) Vice Chair Frances Bilak summarized the discussions and concerns brought forward at the public meetings comprising of the City Council liaisons, RPC representatives, the four synagogues and interested members of the community.

Mayor Gold stated for the record that letters were received from Marcia Hollander in opposition, Scott Karlan in support, Ray Williams in support (via phone with Timmi Tway), and a letter from the attorneys representing Young Israel of North Beverly Hills/The Beverly Hills Synagogue in general opposition and specific concerns related to the MND.

Mr. Gohlich explained the process in which this project, per State law, is subject to an environmental review under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A Mitigated Negative Declaration for this project was prepared due to no significant environmental impacts with the incorporation of mitigation measures.

Council directed staff to send the item back to the RPC for further discussion, and continue outreach to interested persons.

August 25, 2015

Tab 3. Dog Park Discussion

Community Services Director Steve Zoet reviewed the location and size of the proposed dog park. The City Council has requested that the Recreation and Parks Commission reach out to the area surrounding the proposed dog park site (including residential and business areas) and solicit public comment. Approximately 1,300 notices were mailed within an approximate 1,000

foot radius. Prior to the meeting, 47 emails were received with 41 noting support for the project and 6 against the project. Summary documentation was provided in the Commission packet and at the Commission Meeting. Representatives from Community Development were in attendance for questions about the recent Mitigated Negative Declaration Document that was presented to City Council.

The commission listened to comments from the following speakers:

Bill Crowe
Tracy Jones — reading statement from Ten Austin/representing The Amanda Foundation
Lou Milkowski
Jerry Sweet
Martin Watson
Hilary Kraft
Ten Austin
Craig Davis
Eric Cohen
Marcia Hobbs
Kimberly Reiss
Roark Lam berton-Davies
Sharka DiVito
Terrie Gerber
Ilona Sherman
Mark Elliot
Scott Mcintosh
Sharon Persovski
Alma & Stephanie Ordaz
Linda Maman
Tina Sinatra
Steve Kessler
Arthur Cohen

All speakers were in support of the identified location of the dog park with varied comments on park hours, resident/non-resident, and small/large dog area.

Councilmember Liii Bosse addressed the commission to clarify next steps on this topic.

Commissioners recorded the following votes:

MOVED by Rosoff, SECONDED by Anderson, that the location of the dog park will be at the southeast corner of Foothill Road and Alden Drive. (5/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Anderson, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman

NOES: NONE

ABSENT: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

MOVED by Gersh, SECONDED by Bilak, that the proposed dog park will be open 7 days a week consistent with primary park hours, 6 a.m. to 10 p.m. (5/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Anderson, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

MOTION by Friedman, SECONDED by Rosoff, that prior to the October Recreation and Parks Commission Meeting, a discussion about resident/non-resident access, whether licensing/ID Cards will be necessary, the number of dogs per person allowed, the division of small and large dog areas, and design features of the dog park, will take place. In addition, a Special Meeting will be held on site to be open to the public. (5/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Anderson, Getsh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: NONE
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

The Commission took a break at 3:36 p.m.

September 8, 2015

Tab 1. Site Visit to Proposed Dog Park Location: Southeast Corner of Alden Drive/Foothill Road, Beverly Hills, California, 90210

The Recreation and Parks Commission and staff met at the proposed dog park location at 9:20 a.m. at the southeast corner of Foothill Road and Alden Drive, for a site visit with the public present. Once the tour was completed, all returned to continue the meeting in Room 280-A.

Tab 2. Proposed items for Discussion and Action Regarding the Dog Park

The meeting reconvened at 10:20 a.m.

The commission listened to comments from the following speakers:

Lou Milkowski
Dr. Carlton Lee

Elyse Salend
Vera Markowitz
Rabbi Mendel Shusterman
Dr. Sharon Ignarro
Michael Baum
Teri Austin
Anna Baum Novak
Bill Crowe
Marcia Hobbs
Cecile Gromis
Marc Saleh
Nefahel Boram
June Brenner
Linda Maman
Paula Peck
Vicki Talbot
Roark Lamberton-Davies

Comments from speakers included socialization aspects of a dog park, not accommodating the park rules and use to any particular group, noise created by the dog park, limiting the number of dogs allowed in the park at one time, financial/budget questions, suggestions for alternate locations for a dog park, how the mitigation of the area would be handled, security concerns, support for an oversight committee, support from the local dog rescue organization located across the street from proposed park, concerns with traffic and parking in the area, resident/non-resident access, general support for the dog park project, restroom locations, design features and exits.

The Commission took a break at 11:26 a.m.
The meeting resumed at 11:35 a.m.

Chair Friedman explained the Commission wants to be thorough and discuss all components in the Staff Report. Attempt will be made to discuss each item and if a conclusion is not reached, further investigation will be made and the matter will be resolved by the October Commission Meeting in order to present their recommendations to City Council.

Mandana Motahari, a Principal with RTK Architects, Inc., provided explanation of the conceptual drawings for the Dog Park.

After Commissioner discussion, the following votes were recorded:

Residency:

MOVED by Bilak, SECONDED by Friedman, that for the purposes of the first dog park in Beverly Hills that we restrict the park to Beverly Hills Residents, those who own a business or work in Beverly Hills, and those who are guests of Beverly Hills hotels or residents, provided that they are able to display a vaccination and health status of the dog and obtain a permit from the City of Beverly Hills and display a tag to denote residency. (3/1)

AYES: Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: Rosoff
ABSENT: Anderson

ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Licensing:

MOTION by Friedman, SECONDED by Gersh, that every dog visiting our dog park is required to be licensed and in good health and spayed or neutered. If they are exempt from being spayed or neutered, they are to provide documentation. (4/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Allowable number of dogs per person:

MOTION by Friedman, SECONDED by Rosoff, that there be a limit of three dogs per person when visiting the park. (4/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Allowable number of dogs in the park:

MOTION by Rosoff, SECONDED by Gersh, that the dog park be separated for small and large dogs. For purposes of definition, a small dog would be 25 lbs. and under. The maximum number of dogs allowed would be 20 small dogs and 20 large dogs, totaling 40 dogs in the entire park. (4/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Dog Breed Restriction:

MOTION by Friedman, SECONDED by Gersh, that there will be no restrictions on the breed of dogs allowed in the dog park; all breeds are welcome. (4/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Patron Age Limits:

MOTION by Bilak, SECONDED by Rosoff, that children under the age of 14 must be accompanied by an adult in the dog park. (4/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman

NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

The Commission took a break at 1:00 p.m.
The meeting resumed at 1:30 p.m.

Design Components:

The Commission discussed design concepts for the dog park including the double-entry gate system, shade areas, plantings, benches, other amenities in the park and vehicular access into the park for maintenance. Architect will further refine drawings and present at a future Commission Meeting. No action taken.

Surface Material:

MOTION by Rosoff, SECONDED by Friedman, that the Recreation and Parks Commission rejects the use of dirt, grass or wood chips as a surface for the dog park. Decomposed Granite is the preferred ground cover but the Commission would like to further research the feasibility of artificial turf for use in dog parks. (4/0)

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Restrooms:

MOTION by Rosoff, SECONDED by Gersh, that the Commission recommends one port-a-pottie for each area (small dog/large dog). Specific locations will be determined after further review. (3/1)

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Friedman
NOES: Bilak
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Park Amenities:

The Commission discussed benches and tables, bag holders and bags, water fountains, and security cameras. No action taken.

Park Hours:

MOTION by Gersh, SECONDED by Rosoff, that the dog park hours will be 6 a.m. to 10 p.m., the same as primary park hours.

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Friedman
NOES: Bilak
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Park Rules:

MOTION by Friedman, SECONDED Bilak, by that he rules be accepted with changes and additions proposed by the Commission. Staff and Commissioners can further modify rules after cross referencing with existing Beverly Hills Park Rules.

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

The Commission took a break at 3:05 p.m.
The meeting resumed at 3:15 p.m.

Operating Costs and Access Concerns:

MOTION by Rosoff, SECONDED Bilak, by that there will be no annual or other fee to use the dog park. The Commission strongly supports a "Friends of the Dog Park" group. The Commission also recommends further investigation into the possibility/economics of a key coded entry/device for entry.

AYES: Rosoff, Gersh, Bilak, Friedman
NOES: NONE
ABSENT: Anderson
ABSTAIN: NONE
CARRIED

Mitigated Negative Declaration:

No action taken.

Requests/Concerns of Neighboring Synagogues:

The Commission discussed change of original entry point, possible plantings to mitigate concerns of noise traveling, and staffing. No action taken.

The Commission also discussed a "Sunset Clause" proposed by the neighboring synagogues, to close the park if issues arise. It was decided that the Commission would prefer to monitor the park's operations closely throughout the next months and if problems arise they be addressed directly to the Recreation and Parks Commission.

Next step will be to get design features the Commission proposed represented with drawings from RTK Associates. These will be discussed at the next Commission Meeting.

**Tab 3. Consideration to Revise September 29, 2015, Recreation and Parks
Commission Special Meeting**

Commissioners determined that the next Recreation and Parks Commission Special Meeting would remain on the scheduled date of Tuesday, September 29, 2015. Start time will be 9:30 a.m.

After this date, correspondence was received that the September date was an observed Jewish Holiday.

October 13, 2015

**Tab 2. Review of Proposed Dog park Design Options and Additionally Required Action
Items**