STAFF REPORT

CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
September 4, 2008
PL 0830191

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Ivy Nguyen, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at **601 North Crescent Dr.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Commission previously reviewed this project at a Commission meeting of July 2, 2008. The proposed project will be a new, two-story, 6,682 square foot single-family residence with a 746 square foot detached, three-car garage and accessory structure located at **601 North Crescent Drive.**

The Commission heard presentations from staff and recommended the design re-studied and returned addressing the following concerns:

- Vegetation to be planted in front of Carmelita wall;
- Consider "clipping" wall at front of property and soften with additional landscaping;
- Consider window sizes, shapes and alignment at front elevation;
- Front entryway needs to be redesigned to match architectural style of house;
- If the magnolia tree dies, it must be replaced in like kind and size;
- The facades, as presented, are not in symmetry and need to be re-studied;
- The massing needs to be more articulated.

REVISED DESIGN

The applicant addressed the Commission's concerns above as follows:

- The solid wall along Carmelita Avenue has been modified to include wrought iron fencing and landscaping. Trachelospermum jasminoides (star jasmine) plants will be planted along Carmelita Avenue
- Fence along the property line curves at the Carmelita Avenue and Crescent Drive intersection, with low growing plants proposed (French Lavender and Big Blue Lily Turf) in front of and behind the fence
- The windows at the front elevation remain the same size and shape; however, they have been aligned to create more symmetry on the front façade
- Wrought iron decorative railings at the balconies have been simplified
- Precast concrete entryway remains as the applicant maintains that this architectural element is consistent with Spanish designs and has provided a material board for the Commission's review of residences exhibiting such entryways
- The magnolia tree that was to be relocated from the rear of the property to the front yard will no longer be salvaged
- Roof eaves are maximum allowed by Code
- Front entryway wider and deeper than previously proposed, creating more articulation at front façade
- Tower element reconfigured to be circular

A copy of the July 2, 2008 staff report is attached for reference.

Adherence to Zoning Code

Since the previous submission, the application for a detached 21' tall accessory structure for a Central R-1 permit that was to be reviewed by the Planning Commission, has been withdrawn. The applicant has revised the accessory structure to be a 12'-6" tall building to be used as a pool house at the rear of the property.

As proposed, the main house, detached garage, accessory structure and wall meet all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Samuel Moon
Project Owner	David Harte / Severin Properties, LLC
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – North of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	16,300 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on June 20, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. A second notice was mailed on August 25, 2008 because the public hearing was still open and the case was not continued from July 2, 2008 to a date certain. To date, Staff has not received any comments in regards to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed to be in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued (construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone).

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. ***The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.***

   Staff previously commented that the proposed design appears to be an internally compatible design in a Mediterranean theme. However, there was discussion of whether or not the front entryway surround was compatible with the architectural style of the residence. The applicant maintains with supporting documentation that it is consistent with Spanish architecture.

2. ***Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.***

   Staff previously commented that additional modulation may be considered to minimize the appearance of scale and mass. The applicant created additional

depth with the front entryway surround to be 2' deep and the front entryway recessed 2'-6".

The decorative wrought iron has been simplified and is consistently utilized at the fence surrounding the property and along the Juliette balconies on the second floor.

Additionally, the applicant has provided landscaping in front of and behind the fence surrounding the property at the suggestion of the Commission.

Although the applicant will be removing the existing magnolia tree in the rear of the property, the proposed landscaping plan includes existing mature trees at the front of the property and a variety of plant materials that will enhance the garden quality of the city.

3. ***The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.***

The design as discussed in criteria 1 and as modified pursuant to criteria 2 above could enhance the appearance of the neighborhood. The proposed development utilizes thoughtful, high quality building materials including stucco walls with wood doors and windows and decorative detailing, which will further enhance the appearance of the neighborhood. A landscape plan has been submitted to provide for screening and enhancement of the neighborhood.

4. ***The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.***

A 12'-6" tall accessory structure will be built at the rear of the property. The structure will be set 4' from the northern property line, as allowed by Code, and is adjacent to a neighbor's accessory structure. No windows at the northern elevation adjacent to the neighbor have been specified in the plans. The proposed project is not expected to create adverse impacts associated with privacy of neighbors, although the Commission may wish to consider landscaping at the northern property line to provide additional privacy for the abutting neighbor.

5. ***The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

The proposed development is a large house located on a corner lot at Carmelita Avenue and Crescent Drive. The proposed residence will be consistent with the

southerly neighbor as it is also a large home, and will provide for a degree of modulation along the southern elevation. The northerly neighbor is a one-story residence. Therefore, it appears that the proposed development is in harmony with the old and new residences in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;

2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;

3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or

4. Return the plans for restudy and re-submittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, Staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. Applicant shall maintain planting along the gate surrounding the front and street side elevation and shall comply with the height restrictions set forth in the Code.

IVY NGUYEN
Assistant Planner

STAFF REPORT

CITY OF BEVERLY HILLS

For the Design Review
Commission Meeting of
July 2, 2008
PL 0830191

TO: Design Review Commission

FROM: Ivy Nguyen, Assistant Planner

SUBJECT: A request for an R-1 Design Review Permit to allow a new two-story single-family residence, located in the Central Area of the City, north of Santa Monica Boulevard at **601 North Crescent Dr.**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Samuel Moon, on behalf of the property owner, has filed an application for Track 2 design review to allow a new, two-story, 6,682 square foot single-family residence with a 746 square foot detached, three-car garage located at **601 North Crescent Drive.** The applicant is also proposing a one-story, 21' tall, 983 square foot library accessory building at the rear of the property, which will be under review by the Planning Commission for a Central R-1 permit at a meeting in July 2008.

The proposed project has been defined by the applicant as "Spanish" style; however, in staff's opinion, the proposed design is of a more general Mediterranean style, with both Italian and Spanish influences.

Reason for Review by the Commission

The proposed residence is located on a large corner lot at North Crescent Drive and Carmelita Avenue, with a street side yard at the southern elevation. The property would be built to its maximum allowed floor area on the lot (proposing 8,011 square feet out of the allowable 8,020 square feet). It is the Commission's policy to review the design of new houses, on large corner lots that maximize allowed floor area.

Adherence to Zoning Code

As proposed, the main house, detached garage and wall meet all required zoning standards including height, setbacks, parking, and floor area requirements.

Entry to the detached three-car garage will be from Carmelita Avenue and will require a new 24' wide curb cut from the Department of Public Works and Transportation (which has been approved).

The Planning Commission will review the proposed accessory structure at the rear as the height of the structure will be above 14'. The accessory structure would be hidden from public view by the main house and the detached garage and, as a result, would not require design review if approved.

GENERAL INFORMATION	
Applicant	Samuel Moon
Project Owner	David Harte / Severin Properties, LLC
Zoning District	Central R-1 Area – North of Santa Monica Boulevard
Parcel Size	16,300 square feet
Listed in City's Historic Survey	No

SITE AND AREA CHARACTERISTICS

The project site is a trapezoidal-shaped lot that is approximately 96-feet wide by 171-feet long lot (lot average width and length), located on the northwest corner of the 600 block of North Crescent Drive between Elevado Avenue and Carmelita Avenue. The current property contains a two-story residence with a two-story accessory building and one-story pool house at the rear. The existing residence and accessory buildings will be demolished in order to allow for the construction of the proposed project. The abutting neighbor at the north is a one story single-family residence; the southerly neighbor is a two-story residence separated by Carmelita Way.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Building Envelope / Modulation

The proposed residence would have a total floor area of 8,011 square feet, which is nearly the maximum allowable building area (8,020 square feet) for the subject site.

As proposed, the residence will be 31'-2" to the highest point of the roof (32 feet maximum height allowed as each side setback is at least 10'), with an approximately 61-foot wide front façade. The main entrance to the proposed structure consists of a pre-cast concrete covered entry with single custom-fit wood door. The design of the house provides modulation along the south elevation of the building facing Carmelita Way, with two recessed balconies (by approximately 20' from the side lot line) and inset windows at the first floor (approximately one foot deep).

Parking

As required by the BHMC, four parking spaces are required for the seven-bedroom project (six bedrooms in the main residence). The proposed parking will be provided in a newly constructed three-car garage entering at the south elevation from Carmelita Way and one uncovered space at the rear of the property, which will be accessible from the alley.

Design

The proposed design of the structure includes the following features:

- Two stories
- Low, pitched Mission tile roof
- Balconies with wood railings
- Decorative iron work at windows
- Wood windows and doors
- Recessed arched entry
- Stucco wall surface in white
- 6-foot tall wrought iron fence with pilasters.

As proposed, the balance of the design appears to adhere to the characteristics typically found in a combination of Spanish Colonial and Italianate style residences (with the possible exception of the front entry surround and perimeter wall\fence).

Materials

The materials and color proposed for the new structure are as follows:

- Rough trowel stucco finish – Benjamin Moore "Decorator White"
- Pre-cast concrete moldings at roof eave and entry façade – light taupe color
- Mission Tile roof - Terra cotta
- Wrought iron railings and fences
- Custom-fit, arch top wood door at entryway
- Decorative tiles on risers at exterior steps

- Copper gutter.

Paving

The total amount of paving permitted within the front yard of the subject site can be no more than 33% of the area. The proposed project includes a total of 320 square feet walkway of paving within the front yard, significantly less than the 1,338 square feet permitted paving by the BHMC. The majority of the front yard will consist of mature vegetation.

Landscape Design

The proposed project will provide for new landscaping surrounding the property and low-growing shrubs in front of the fence at the front yard and side yard. Additionally, a Magnolia tree, Crape Myrtle tree and Paradise Palm tree will be relocated from the rear of the property to the front yard. The common names of some of the species specified in the landscaping plan will include the following:

- Queen Palm
- Pittosporum
- Viburnum
- Fescue Turf for ground cover
- Big Blue Lily Turf
- Magnolia Tree (Relocated from Rear)
- Chokecherry "Bright and Tight"

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notice of the proposed project and public hearing was mailed on June 20, 2008 to all property owners and residential tenants within a 100-foot radius from the exterior boundaries of the property as required by Code. To date, Staff has not received any comments in regards to the submitted plans.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION

The project has been reviewed to be in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the City's environmental guidelines, and a Categorical Exemption of Class 3(a) has been issued (construction of a single-family residence in a residential zone).

DESIGN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to BHMC Section 10-3-4415, the Design Review Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or disapprove the issuance of a building permit in any matter subject to its jurisdiction after considering whether the proposed development complies

with the following criteria. If the proposed project meets the criteria set forth, the Commission shall approve the application. When the proposed development does not comply with the criteria, the Commission may impose such conditions it deems necessary to bring the proposed development into conformity with the provisions of this article.

1. ***The proposed development's design exhibits an internally compatible design scheme.***

   The proposed design and architectural features are similar to those defined in the Design Catalogue for the Spanish Colonial and Italianate styles. The balance of proposed design appears to exhibit an internally compatible design scheme in a Mediterranean theme. The Commission may wish to discuss whether the front entry surround and the fence surrounding the house are consistent with the style.

2. ***Appropriately minimizes the appearance of scale and mass, enhances the garden like quality of the city, and appropriately maximizes the use of required open space within the proposed architectural style.***

   The proposed design utilizes nearly the maximum amount of floor area permitted by the BHMC. The proposed height of the main residence is 31'-2" (maximum height allowed by Code is 32').

   The proposed façade provides a degree of modulation as a portion of the front is set back approximately 4' to 5' from the front setback. The façade has been articulated at the southern elevation with two recessed balconies and the windows have been inset by approximately 6". However, this modulation may not minimize the appearance of scale and mass of the proposed structure. The Commission may wish to discuss opportunities for providing additional modulation along the front façade and the south street side elevation.

   The Commission may wish to consider whether the wrought iron fence surrounding the property and the similar railing at the balconies will contribute to the appearance of bulk and mass of the development. The Commission may wish simplify the ornate design.

   For the Commission's consideration, the entryway surround consists of a 14' tall precast concrete façade that may contribute to the bulk and mass of the residence.

   The Commission may also wish to consider as a condition, screening the 7' wall at the Carmelita street side rather than the low-growing plants proposed.

   The proposed landscaping plan includes mature trees and a variety of plant materials and will enhance the garden quality of the city.

3. ***The development will enhance the appearance of the neighborhood.***

   The proposed project exhibits an internally compatible design scheme with the possible exception of the front entry surround and perimeter fence. The project utilizes thoughtful, high quality building materials including stucco walls with wood doors and windows and decorative detailing (such as balconies and tiles), which will help to enhance the appearance of the neighborhood. The Commission may wish to consider additional modulation that will further enhance the appearance as compared to the surrounding neighborhood.

4. ***The proposed development is designed to balance the reasonable expectation of development for the owner with the reasonable expectation of privacy of neighbors.***

   As discussed in item 2 above, the proposed project utilizes the maximum amount of floor area allowed by the BHMC, and may benefit from additional modulation, which would help to create a better balance between development potential and the privacy of adjacent properties. However, the proposed project meets, and at some areas, exceeds the side setbacks required by the BHMC.

   Of note, there will be a Conservatory and approximately 44' wide balcony that will be built at the rear of the property, at the northwest elevation. However, both elements will be set at least 10' from the lot line that abuts the neighbors and will, furthermore, be shielded by shrubbery.

   Therefore, the proposed project is not expected to create adverse impacts associated with privacy of neighbors.

5. ***The proposed development respects prevailing site design pattern, carefully analyzing the characteristics of the surrounding group of homes, and integrates appropriate features that will ensure harmony between old and new.***

   The properties along North Crescent Drive are developed with structures varying in size and scale and there does not appear to be a consistent design pattern at present; however, most homes can be classified as revival styles such as Colonial, Spanish, or Italian in design. Therefore, it appears that the proposed development is in harmony with the old and new residences in the surrounding area.

Upon consideration of criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3-4415, The Commission has the following options:

1. Approve the plans as presented;

2. Approve the plans subject to the following and /or other conditions, to bring the plans into conformance with criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415;

3. Disapprove the plans upon detailed findings that certain criteria set forth in BHMC 10-3.4415 are not met; or

4. Return the plans for restudy and re-submittal.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the foregoing analysis and pending the information and conclusions that may result from testimony received at the public hearing, as well as Design Review Commission deliberations, Staff recommends the Design Review Commission either provide the applicant with further direction and return the item for restudy, or approve the project with the following conditions and any other conditions the Commission may wish to add:

1. Applicant redesign fence\wall surrounding the property with particular attention to simplifying the wrought iron design. The same wrought iron design should be consistent with the balcony railings on the façade.

2. Applicant consider more extensive vegetation at the 7' wall facing Carmelita Avenue.

3. Applicant redesign the front entry surround to be more consistent with the style of the house.

IVY NGUYEN
Assistant Planner